

BOARD OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK

COMMISSIONERS' COVER SHEET REVIEW

42 Broadway
New York, NY 10004
April 3, 2020
12:00 - 12:50 p.m.

April 3, 2020

PRESENT:

Commissioner Miguelina Camilo

Commissioner John Wm. Zaccone

Steven Richman, General Counsel

1 April 3, 2020

2 (The meeting commenced at 12:02 p.m.)

3 MR. STEVEN RICHMAN: Friday, April 3rd,
4 two minutes after noon, this is a meeting of
5 Board of Elections in the City of New York's
6 Commissioner's Cover Sheet and Petition Review
7 Committee. This committee was established on
8 Tuesday at the meeting of the board held by video
9 conference in accordance with the governor's
10 executive order and pursuant to rule two of the
11 Board's designated petition rules. This meeting
12 as well is being conducted by a video conference
13 to ensure that everyone observes the required
14 social distancing. Today's committee consists of
15 Commissioner Camilo of Bronx County and
16 Commissioner Zaccone of Richmond County.
17 Commissioners, can you both hear me?

18 COMMISSIONER MIGUELINA CAMILO: Yes.

19 COMMISSIONER JOHN WM. ZACCONE: Yes, I
20 can.

21 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, we have e-
22 mailed you a PDF of each of the items we're about
23 to present to you and I believe I have them in
24 the same order as the PDF, so with your

1 April 3, 2020

2 permission, we'll begin calling them and we'll go
3 forward. The procedure we've utilized is after we
4 make the presentation, I'll request an
5 authorization to send the appropriate notice. I'd
6 ask each of you to verbalize that and then we'll
7 report that on the report form.

8 So the first matter relates to the cover
9 sheet for Ronald Kim, Working Families Party,
10 Assembly, for member of the New York State
11 Assembly, from the 40th AD. The defect
12 commissioners, and you have both the cover sheet
13 and the petition there. The cover sheet lists the
14 address differently from the petition. The
15 petition has the house numbers 140-70 Ash Avenue,
16 and on the cover sheet, it's listed as 131-05
17 [unintelligible] [00:01:44] Road. The cover sheet
18 is supposed to match the petition.

19 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: And the address
20 is clearly not even close.

21 MR. RICHMAN: No.

22 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree.

23 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I approve also to
24 send notice.

1 April 3, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. Notice will go
3 out. And that'll give them three business days to
4 cure, which would make it next Wednesday.
5 Commissioners, the next item relates to a cover
6 sheet filed for Candidate Risa Kingston
7 [phonetic], for the party position of assembly
8 district leader female 29th AD Part B, and
9 Reddington Tate, according to the petition, he's
10 the candidate for the assembly district leader
11 male 29th Assembly District Part B. You have a
12 copy of the petition as well, in which is Volume
13 Queens 684. The defects are as follows.

14 On the cover sheet filed, one, there is
15 no claim of valid signature. Two, the zip code
16 for the female district leader is on the
17 petition, but it's only the cover sheet, and
18 three, the description of the party position for
19 the male district leader omits the AD number.
20 It's on the petition, but it's not on the cover
21 sheet. It's only Part B. We recommend a notice of
22 noncompliance go out to the candidates, since we
23 don't have a contact person, advising them of
24 their respective defects and giving them the

1 April 3, 2020

2 three days to cure it.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I would approve.

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree, yes.

5 Sorry, commissioner. I agree as well.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Commissioners, the
7 next item relates to the cover sheet filed for
8 the Queens, for Democratic Party Queens County,
9 for Alison C. Abulafi and Peter W. Beadle, for
10 positions of male and female Assembly District
11 leader 28th AD, Part B. They claim on their cover
12 sheet two volumes, including Queens 2000482, a
13 copy of which you have. They do not appear on
14 that volume, Volume 2000482 has the candidates
15 for the 28th Assembly District district leaders
16 Part A, not B.

17 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Mr. Richamn, I
18 was looking at that cover sheet.

19 MR. RICHMAN: Yes?

20 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: And it looks like
21 there was an interlineation for the --

22 MR. RICHMAN: No, I'm sorry --

23 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: -- two.

24 MR. RICHMAN: -- that's the red line

1 April 3, 2020

2 that our staff made for the [unintelligible]

3 [00:04:30].

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Oh, okay. That's
5 what I wanted to ask about. My apologies.

6 MR. RICHMAN: They checked off as they
7 were going through it, where they should have
8 circled it, but the team instead drew a line
9 through it, and then they wrote up here --

10 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: No, I just wanted
11 clarification. I wasn't sure who did it. If your
12 staff, if our staff did it --

13 MR. RICHMAN: Our staff [unintelligible]
14 [00:04:45].

15 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: -- and
16 [unintelligible] [00:04:47] claimed it.

17 MR. RICHMAN: And they, they still
18 claimed two volumes in the total number of
19 volumes on the card. So they'd have to correct it
20 by deleting the volume and changing
21 [unintelligible] [00:04:56].

22 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Commissioner, do
23 the honors.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Yes, so I approve

1 April 3, 2020

2 sending notice.

3 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I also approve,
4 thank you Mr. Richman.

5 MR. RICHMAN: Next potential defect
6 relates to the address appearing for Heather C.
7 Dimitriadis, the delegate to the Democratic
8 Judicial Convention for the 11th AD 24th Assembly
9 District, Queens. Commissioners, on both of the
10 petition volumes on which the candidate appears,
11 the apartment is listed as Apartment 3C, as in
12 Charlie. On the cover sheet, it is listed as 3G
13 as in George. The Cover Sheet is supposed to
14 match the petition. We'd ask them to correct the
15 cover sheet by volume and the cover sheet
16 petition, petition [unintelligible] [00:05:56].

17 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I approve sending
18 notice.

19 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree as well.
20 Or we'll probably end up with a printer's error
21 letter somewhere along the line.

22 MR. RICHMAN: The next item relates to
23 the candidacy of the, Candidate Jesse Layon,
24 member of the Democratic State Committee male

1 April 3, 2020

2 from the 37th AD in Queens and delegate to the
3 Judicial Convention from the 37th AD in Queens.
4 On the petition volume which you have attached,
5 it shows his zip code as 11106 in Astoria. On the
6 cover sheet, it's listed as 11206, which would
7 put it in a different borough.

8 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Mm-hmm.

9 MR. RICHMAN: We will extend them a
10 notice to correct the cover sheet with your
11 permission.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

13 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Yes, I concur.

14 MR. RICHMAN: Next relates to candidate
15 running for member of the Kings County Democratic
16 County Committee from the 48th Assembly District
17 but on the schedule, the assembly
18 [unintelligible] [00:07:30], Michael Troy and
19 Brady Gumbo. Commissioners, what is missing, the
20 defect is that the petition number is omitted
21 from the schedule. They appear on page 31,
22 [unintelligible] [00:07:43] everything else in
23 that district is Volume 263, but that number is
24 omitted in the files. So that should be done, so

1 April 3, 2020

2 they should be correcting that by adding that
3 number.

4 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

5 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree, approve.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, this is for
7 the county committee designating petition for
8 Bronx County, the 82nd Assembly District for 49th
9 AD, they've include Virgio, sorry, Vera Giorgio
10 and Ralph Giorgio. In the schedule there, they
11 include the page number on which the signatures
12 appear, but again, they omitted the volume number
13 and the number of volumes. We believe it's in
14 Bronx 270 but we'd ask the contact person to make
15 the correction.

16 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

17 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I approve also.

18 MR. RICHMAN: The next defect relates to
19 Kings County petition, Kings 2000234, and this
20 commissioners, is, again, it's a discretionary
21 aspect, it's up to you. On the county committee
22 schedule, they included middle initial, and the
23 address is the same, the apartment number is the
24 same. On the petition, it is not included.

1 April 3, 2020

2 Technically, this is, it doesn't exactly match
3 the petition, but in the past a de minimus error
4 like that that doesn't confuse the voter like
5 including the middle initial, prior commissioner
6 committees have found that not to be an
7 [unintelligible] [00:09:46]. That would be our
8 recommendation.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I would agree. I
10 don't think that's a fatal defect.

11 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I concur, as long
12 as there's not, you know, any intent of
13 confusion, intent to confuse, I'm okay with that
14 and I would vote no.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioner,
16 and when we checked the voter registration
17 though, she is registered with her middle
18 initial. But, uh, again, middle initial, under
19 our rules, you have to have a first and last
20 name. So, thank you. No letter will be needed.

21 Next item relates to that schedule
22 submitted for members of the Kings County
23 Democratic County Committee. Again, in this case,
24 candidate for the county committee, Miles McAfee

1 April 3, 2020

2 [unintelligible] [00:10:56] 23rd AD, again, in
3 this case, the middle initial on the schedule,
4 which it doesn't appear on the petition.

5 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Sure, Miles E.
6 Versus Miles.

7 MR. RICHMAN: Right. I make the same
8 recommendation that this is not a significant
9 defect [unintelligible] [00:11:18] because you
10 [unintelligible] [00:11:19] and others is
11 recommending [unintelligible] [00:11:21].

12 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I concur.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I approve also.

14 MR. RICHMAN: Democratic Party, Kings
15 County relating to the county committee schedule
16 for the 56th AD and the 7th ED, the name that is
17 listed on the schedule is, doesn't match the
18 petition, the first name on the petition is R-E-
19 N-Y-E-H, and it's spelled R-E-N-Y-A-H on the
20 schedule. We'd ask that, we'd recommend that the
21 schedule be corrected to match the petition.

22 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I would approve to
23 send notice.

24 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree as well.

1 April 3, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.
3 The next potential defect relates to the cover
4 sheets filed by Mohammad R., on behalf of
5 Mohammad R. Townsley [phonetic] for assembly
6 district leader male, 32nd AD Part A in Queens.
7 The defect, commissioners, is that on the cover
8 sheet he did not list the total number of
9 volumes. He only listed volume ID number, he'd
10 have to correct it by filing an amended cover
11 sheet, claiming the one [unintelligible]
12 [00:13:02] volumes one and the volume number.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

14 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners,
16 next defect, similarly for the delegates to the
17 Democratic Party, Queens County, the delegates to
18 the 11th Judicial District for 32nd AD,
19 candidates Poppy Ramon [phonetic], same defect as
20 before, they omitted the number, the total number
21 of volumes on the petition [unintelligible]
22 [00:13:32].

23 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

24 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Again, I approve

1 April 3, 2020

2 as well.

3 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, this is the
4 county committee schedule for the 43rd Assembly
5 District, Kings County, relating to three, two,
6 two election districts for each candidate, 76th
7 Election District candidate Gregory Mellon
8 [phonetic] and Assembly 7th Election District
9 candidates Ridas Bigay Balabaal [phonetic] and
10 Mary Moses [phonetic], again, they claim one
11 volume, they put the page numbers, but they did
12 not put the volume number, with the signature.

13 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree.

14 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, relating to
16 Bronx petition 273, the county committee
17 schedule, first one, first page, the first page
18 of the schedule just [unintelligible] [00:14:59]
19 AD [unintelligible] [00:15:03] The first defect
20 here is -- well, here it is on the first page, in
21 the 1st ED, the candidate name was misspelled, I
22 think two candidates names, Hilda Diaz and
23 Christina Ricard in the 1st ED. On the petition,
24 it's, the candidate, it should be Christina

1 April 3, 2020

2 Ricard, R-I-C-A-R-D and for Hilda Diaz, the
3 address is mismatched. [unintelligible]
4 [00:15:58] Diaz on the petition, it's 880 Boynton
5 Avenue, and on the schedule, it's 820. So we have
6 misspelling of the last name for Richard, uh,
7 Ricard, in the 1st ED and the address for Diaz.
8 [unintelligible] [00:16:16] send notice to have
9 [unintelligible] [00:16:16].

10 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I approve, yes.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve as well.

12 MR. RICHMAN: The next defect relating
13 to the --

14 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Same petition.

15 MR. RICHMAN: -- 83rd ED, Candidate
16 Castillo Karen Rosario [phonetic], they claim
17 that they have the sufficient signatures, they
18 put the volume number and the total number of
19 volumes. They did not indicate the page numbers
20 on which those signatures appear. To be valid,
21 they have to do that so we can issue them a
22 notice to amend the schedule for the 83rd ED.

23 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

24 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I approve as

1 April 3, 2020

2 well.

3 MR. RICHMAN: And the last one relating
4 to that schedule, in the 16 ED for candidates
5 Denise and Edgar Moscow [phonetic]. They issued,
6 they claimed sufficient number of signatures,
7 they put the ID number in for the petition, but
8 they do not include the page numbers. We'd ask
9 them to correct it and file an amended schedule
10 for that ED as well.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

12 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Approved as well.

13 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.
14 Commissioners, the next defect relates to the
15 candidates for delegate to the Democratic
16 Judicial Convention from the 29th AD in Queens,
17 and alternate delegates, the slate beginning with
18 Pamela Hazel [phonetic] and delegate Renford Tate
19 [phonetic] and all those beneath, Diana Hodges
20 [phonetic], [unintelligible] [00:18:15] Smith,
21 here again, apparently, again, they filed an
22 individual sheet not part of the full schedule
23 with, again, so that there's no volume numbers
24 listed on the cover sheet. All we have is the,

1 April 3, 2020

2 they have the next page, which they have in this
3 case, a contact person, and the petition, it
4 claims a sufficient number of signatures, but we
5 don't have the volume numbers listed and they do
6 appear on volume numbers Queens 684 and 685,
7 which you have a copy of. So we'd ask them to
8 amend the schedule, the cover sheet for the
9 delegates and alternates to include the list of
10 volume numbers on which they appear in.

11 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: The number of
12 volumes and the volume numbers.

13 MR. RICHMAN: And the number, yes, the
14 number of volumes and ID number, yes.

15 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Thank you. Yeah,
16 I approve.

17 MR. RICHMAN: It'll be D and E on the,
18 on the chart.

19 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I also approve.

21 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.

22 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Sorry to be
23 pedantic, Mr. Richman, I just want to make sure
24 they get the right notice.

1 April 3, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: No, you're absolutely
3 right. Commissioners, the question here, now this
4 is both for the cover sheet and or you may want
5 to make a prima facie defect. On the petition and
6 cover sheet, the address listed on both, is 203
7 West 85 T-H 2, New York, New York, 10024. There's
8 no designation where it's street, avenue,
9 boulevard or etc. Technically the cover sheet
10 matches. I think the question is, is the address
11 sufficient and if it's not, I believe that we
12 should make this, we should refer this to a prima
13 facie, because the petition is [unintelligible]
14 [00:20:20].

15 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: The only comment
16 I have, Mr. Richman, is on the cover sheet, the
17 contact person, who is the same as the candidate,
18 it has 203 West 85th Street. That, and, and the
19 fact that, I don't know of any other West 85 in
20 Manhattan but Street.

21 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Commissioners, this
22 is going to come to you also, but if you look at
23 the petition, it says house, New York CD 10, the
24 cover sheet is accurate, they have the correct

1 April 3, 2020

2 description in congress, New York CD 10. But
3 either way, this is coming to you there, but I,
4 if you want to find the cover sheet is valid now,
5 we'll leave it at that, based on the fact that
6 the contact person is also the candidate.

7 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Give me a moment
8 to read through.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I see the same
10 issue is on the petition page towards the bottom.

11 MR. RICHMAN: The petition, that part,
12 Commissioner Camilo, this is also going to appear
13 on the prima facie calendar. So that's also for
14 the office, it'll be an insufficient or
15 inadequate description of the public office being
16 sought.

17 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I, I do see that
18 issue, and I think you're, that one is a valid
19 one. I think the West 85, [unintelligible]
20 [00:21:45].

21 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, the issue
22 before you right now, is technically, the cover
23 sheet matches the petition. We, the staff
24 identified this as the address not

1 April 3, 2020

2 [unintelligible] [00:21:56]. But I have, I would
3 think that you could find it, at least it will,
4 strictly looking at the cover sheet of the
5 petition, this is not a cover sheet, but the
6 cover sheet matches the petition.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: And legal's
8 recommendation is that this is a --

9 MR. RICHMAN: Well, legal is separately
10 recommending that the issue of the description of
11 the public office on the petition itself will
12 appear on your prima facie calendar
13 [unintelligible] [00:22:24].

14 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Right. I, I'm
15 tending to say no on the notice, because it does
16 match, and I think it's sufficient. If this was
17 Queens, I would have an entirely different
18 response, because there could be five or six
19 different West 85s.

20 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Right.

21 MR. RICHMAN: Okay.

22 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: But just because
23 it's Manhattan, I think we're okay, and I would
24 vote no on that.

1 April 3, 2020

2 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I would concur. No
3 notice. It's not a --

4 MR. RICHMAN: It's going after volume
5 and cover sheet, he's still going to get some
6 mail from us about the prima facie.

7 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Exactly.

8 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Commissioners, the
9 next relates to the cover sheet, Democratic Party
10 for Jerrold L. Nadler, the representative in
11 Congress in the 10th Congressional District. They
12 list all the volume numbers, the candidate
13 appears on all of them. What is missing is the
14 total number of volumes comprising the petition.
15 Recommending notice be sent so that they can cure
16 that defect.

17 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

18 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree. And I'm
19 surprised as well.

20 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Yeah, it's pretty
21 [unintelligible] [00:23:31].

22 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, just so
23 you're aware, they've been calling, given the way
24 that petitions are argued, the last set of cover

1 April 3, 2020

2 sheets they reviewed were the Congressionals
3 because they crossed over different boroughs.
4 They've been calling for a week asking when are
5 they getting that notice. But I was indicated
6 that they were watching today, so the notice will
7 be mailed today.

8 The next number, the next relates to the
9 petition of, and cover sheet of Erica Murray,
10 candidate for the Democratic, for the House of
11 Representatives, the 8th Congressional District.
12 Commissioners, on both cover sheets filed within
13 a minute of each other on the last day to file,
14 the volume number is not properly set forth and
15 the total number of volumes in petition doesn't
16 match. They claim 610 and the ID, the volume
17 number is 71, so we'd give the opportunity to
18 cure and identify their volume [unintelligible]
19 [00:24:37].

20 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Yes, I'm curious
21 if they have 610 volumes in their petition. I
22 concur.

23 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I approve too.

24 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. Commissioners,

1 April 3, 2020

2 the next relates to Queens petition 20001009, the
3 petition for Fahim Hamid, county committee member
4 male, 49th ED and the 34th ED. As you can see,
5 it's a two volume, a two-sheet petition, neither
6 which of the page numbers are numbered. We give
7 them a page number and defect cure notice,
8 because there's more than one page, with numbers
9 -- the pages, the sheets of the petition have to
10 be sequentially numbered.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approved sending
12 notice.

13 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I concur.

14 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, the next
15 defect relates to Scherie S. Murray, candidate
16 for House of Representatives 14th ED,
17 commissioners, the cover sheet claimed that she
18 appears in Volume Queens 20- her signatures in
19 support of her candidacy appear in Queens
20 2000783. That volume was never filed. Attached is
21 a copy of Volume Queens 2000784, on which the
22 candidate appears.

23 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I approve.

24 MR. RICHMAN: So the ID number doesn't

1 April 3, 2020

2 match [unintelligible] [00:26:30].

3 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I also approve.

4 MR. RICHMAN: Notice will be issued
5 today.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Next relates to the cover
7 sheet for Richard Parnell Habersham, who is
8 according to his petition, a representative in
9 Congress, seeking to be in the 13th Congressional
10 District. On the petitions you see attached,
11 commissioners, the public office is properly
12 described. On the cover sheet, it just says U.S.
13 representative, New York 13, the cover sheet
14 doesn't really match the petition. We'd ask them
15 to [unintelligible] [00:27:15] --

16 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree with
17 counsel to have the notice sent out.

18 MR. RICHMAN: Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve, approve
20 also.

21 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.
22 Notice will be issued today.

23 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: You'll be happy
24 to note, Mr. Richman, that as we're going through

1 April 3, 2020

2 this, I'm initially.

3 MR. RICHMAN: Oh, okay.

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: This way, I can
5 send it to you afterwards.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Either that, we're also
7 retaining copies of the video copies, so that's
8 why I'm calling specifically just in case. The
9 next relates to the cover sheet for Francesca
10 Castellanos, candidate for representative of the
11 U.S. Congress in the 13th Congressional District,
12 the cover sheet, the total number of volumes is
13 omitted. I'd her -- we'd issue a notice asking
14 them to correct the defect and include the total
15 number of volumes in the petition.

16 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

17 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I agree.

18 MR. RICHMAN: The next relates,
19 commissioners, to the county committee schedule
20 for members of the Kings County, uh, Queens
21 County Democratic county committee for the 24th
22 AD, and the 51st Assembly District. The male
23 candidate's name is omitted from the ballot. On
24 the petition, Pazio R. Matthew Puda [phonetic]

1 April 3, 2020

2 appears as a candidate for that ED, the address
3 listed on the schedule matches the address on the
4 petition, so we'd ask them to correct the
5 schedule and include the candidate's name on it.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Uh --

7 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Approved.

8 MR. RICHMAN: Do you see that,
9 commissioner? You have a copy of the volume
10 there. The two candidates for county committee
11 members, Ms. Shauman's [phonetic] name is
12 appearing over on the schedule in the petition,
13 the male, they just didn't fill in the blanks of
14 the name of the candidate for male for the 51st
15 ED. But he's on the petition. And the address
16 they set forth matches his address.

17 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Concur. The 51 M
18 is blank.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Right. I'm just
20 seeing in the attachments we received, 51, there
21 was one last page that's hand written, April 3rd.

22 MR. RICHMAN: No, that's for the next
23 volume.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Okay. So I approve

1 April 3, 2020

2 the one you just stated for the 51

3 [unintelligible] [00:29:47].

4 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. This is related to
5 petition 427.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Okay.

7 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, that I
8 believe concludes all of the initial review stuff
9 that's here. Now, we're going to be presenting
10 materials submitted in response to notice of
11 noncompliance in terms of the potential cure.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Okay.

13 MR. RICHMAN: This one is a little
14 complicated. It relates, that's why you have so
15 much material. It relates to the candidates --

16 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Michael Arcati,
17 [unintelligible] [00:30:34].

18 MR. RICHMAN: -- [unintelligible]
19 [00:30:35] candidates, Michael, for state
20 committee, Michael Arcati, Gabrielle Cordova,
21 Irwin Mark Weinblatt, and Michael Arcati, for
22 member of the Assembly. Commissioners, they
23 submitted, in response to the original cover
24 sheet you have in front of you, it had six

1 April 3, 2020
2 volumes listed with no ID number. They submitted
3 a document on March 27th, which is two pages,
4 again cover sheet amendment and petition
5 correction. At the bottom of the first page, and
6 the second page, they claim a printer -- he
7 doesn't ID the printer, but he says I'd like to
8 correct the, [unintelligible] [00:31:17]
9 petition, on the [unintelligible] [00:31:18] for
10 the petitions of state committee,
11 [unintelligible] [00:31:21] 2nd Judicial District
12 on the petition. These are candidates in Queens,
13 but the petition reads 2nd Judicial, which is
14 Brooklyn. I hereby request petitions and the
15 cover letter attached [unintelligible] [00:31:34]
16 be corrected accordingly, and amended to be the
17 11th [unintelligible] [00:31:38].

18 Uh, but in addition to that, though,
19 there, the amended cover sheet that this
20 [unintelligible] [00:31:45] is still not correct.
21 But then he goes on to say I respectfully request
22 that the cover sheet be amended to add one of the
23 following ID numbers, Queens 715, 716 and 717, to
24 be assigned by the Board of Elections.

1 April 3, 2020

2 What appears to have happened,
3 commissioners is that when they filed, one the
4 cover sheet was attached to the petition and
5 doesn't have any ID numbers. And he included in
6 his letter, copies of the petition ID numbers he
7 received, which aren't there. It's my
8 understanding according to CRU, that he attaches
9 copies of petition pages upon which no ID numbers
10 appear and no [unintelligible] [00:32:25].

11 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Oh, god.

12 MR. RICHMAN: So, uh, the, from the
13 [unintelligible] [00:32:31], the correct ID
14 number, which is then described as you go back,
15 commissioners, to the first original defective
16 cover sheet, when he filed the volume, there were
17 no ID numbers on the, on the volume. This was
18 attached, the cover sheet was attached to the
19 volume. So CRU affixed Volume number QN2000720 to
20 the volume. This amended cover that he purports
21 to offer [unintelligible] [00:32:58] it's either
22 715, 716, or 717 as Appendix B, none of those are
23 correct. So I would ask that the document
24 entitled cover sheet amendment and petition

1 April 3, 2020

2 correction be deemed not a valid cure of the
3 cover sheet.

4 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I agree with the
5 recommendation, not valid.

6 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I'm just looking
7 through. Give me one second. I, I approve. It's
8 just, it's clearly an invalid cure.

9 MR. RICHMAN: And then we don't even
10 have to deal with the printer's error
11 [unintelligible] [00:33:52], okay. So thank you,
12 commissioners. So we'll mark that as an invalid
13 cure. The candidates will not appear on the
14 ballot and notice will go out today advising.

15 The next item commissioners, we've
16 examined was for Candidate Scherie Murray, 14th
17 Congressional District, the original defects were
18 that there were page numbering defects. Between
19 pages 18 and 19, there were a blank page, then it
20 goes from page 186 to 218, then it skips from 235
21 to 187, 217 jumps to 236. A bipartisan team,
22 including myself, examined the original petition
23 and the purported cure that was filed on, to the
24 Board on March 27th, including a copy of the NCN

1 April 3, 2020

2 notice to identify the cure, [unintelligible]
3 [00:35:08] but we report to you commissioners,
4 that it is a valid cure. In accordance with your
5 instruction, a copy was filed in the exact same
6 order as originally filed, with the corrections
7 inscribed on the copy and the entire petition
8 volume now is sequentially numbered.

9 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Then, I accept it
10 as a valid cure.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I concur.

12 MR. RICHMAN: And please forgive us for
13 not sending you all 475 pages of the petition.

14 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: No, no, no.
15 There's no reason to apologize for that.

16 MR. RICHMAN: That takes care of that.
17 Page numbering, oh, we haven't -- this one --
18 commissioners, this was filed on the, the
19 correction was filed on April 1st, we reviewed it
20 and we find it not to be a valid cure. The
21 original defect was that you had the original
22 petition here following [unintelligible]
23 [00:36:28] page 30 [unintelligible] [00:36:35]

24 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Thirty-nine and

1 April 3, 2020

2 40?

3 MR. RICHMAN: Page 39 has a number
4 inscribed here at the bottom. The next page was
5 blank. And then the next page after that was page
6 40. When they offered the purported cure, they
7 did not submit it in the same order. In this
8 case, what was page 39 in the original remains
9 page 39. They then put the original page 40 next,
10 and then they inscribed the blank page, which was
11 between 39 and 40, which should really be the new
12 40, as page 41. And then they numbered everything
13 else as it was [unintelligible] [00:37:14]. Why
14 they did it, I'm not sure. According to our
15 instructions, then it's not a valid cure, because
16 again, it's not numbered. The petition correction
17 is not in the exact order that it was originally
18 filed.

19 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I, I agree. I
20 think it's problematic [unintelligible]
21 [00:37:33].

22 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I agree as well,
23 not valid.

24 MR. RICHMAN: So we're marking this the

1 April 3, 2020

2 amended correction [unintelligible] [00:37:41]

3 cure.

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Forgive me.

5 MR. RICHMAN: No problem. Commissioners,
6 this goes back to a basic defect. The next item
7 relates to Bronx petition 2000616, Candidate
8 Jonathan Ortiz for representative of Congress for
9 15th CD, the defects are two cover sheets filed,
10 one claimed Bronx 2000609, the other doesn't have
11 an ID number at all, but neither one are valid.
12 They were filed at the same time. The candidate
13 actually appears and you have a copy of
14 [unintelligible] [00:38:59] on Bronx petition
15 2000616. So we'd ask him to file and correct the
16 amended, and file an amended cover sheet
17 correctly stating the correct volume
18 [unintelligible] [00:39:17].

19 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I approve to send
20 notice.

21 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I approve as
22 well.

23 MR. RICHMAN: Next relates to the cover
24 sheet for Adriano Espaillat, Democratic Party for

1 April 3, 2020

2 member of Congress in the 13th CD. The petition
3 claim, the cover sheet claims volume New York
4 2000266, however that volume has not been filed
5 with the Board. So they included a volume that
6 was not filed and they would be given an
7 opportunity to correct the cover sheet and only
8 claim the volumes that are filed.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approved to send
10 notice.

11 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Just when you do,
12 Mr. Richman, I am looking at the cover sheet
13 itself, and they have a whole bunch of volumes
14 that look to have incomplete numbers on them.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Well, no. Commissioner, if
16 you look at this, it says, Bronx on the first
17 line, Bronx 2000 then 261, 265, 267.

18 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Okay. Yeah. I'm
19 just, because I was trying to read it and --

20 MR. RICHMAN: And the next volume --

21 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: -- and the
22 circles makes it difficult, yeah.

23 MR. RICHMAN: The others are the New
24 York volumes 2000 and then the space, and then

1 April 3, 2020

2 they put the three digit codes in, so yeah, we
3 were able to understand that.

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Okay.

5 MR. RICHMAN: With the volumes. And then
6 right now, it totals 14 volumes, which matches.
7 If they remove 266, it'll be 13 volumes.

8 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Alright. Okay.
9 No, that's [unintelligible] [00:40:53]. I was
10 trying to read it and having a little difficulty
11 and so. I think that's all for one, right.

12 MR. RICHMAN: Right. And then number two
13 we'll be going back then with additional amended
14 cover sheet, if you look at [unintelligible]
15 [00:41:07].

16 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Give me one
17 second to get that one up. There we go. Okay.

18 MR. RICHMAN: The first relates to the
19 original cover sheet filed by, on behalf of
20 Karines Reyes, a member of the Assembly 87th AD
21 in the Bronx. The two defects are one, the
22 original cover sheet was attached to the petition
23 and an incorrect ID number was on the petition.
24 They filed an amended co- a notice of

1 April 3, 2020

2 noncompliance went out on the 27th, within the
3 three business days on the 30th, they filed an
4 amended cover sheet, which included the
5 certification that they're authorized to file the
6 amended cover sheet and they corrected cured the
7 defect. You have a copy of Bronx Volume 592,
8 which the candidate appears, so we recommend
9 this, commissioners, to be a valid cure.

10 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

11 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Agree.

12 MR. RICHMAN: The next one relates to
13 the cover sheets for candidate Paperboy Love
14 Prince, for member of Congress from the 7th
15 Congressional District. The original defect was
16 that the -- you have the original defect sheet.
17 The number of volumes was omitted from the cover
18 sheet and the identification numbers claimed were
19 incorrect. They didn't match our system. The
20 notice went out on the 27th. On the 30th, an
21 amended cover sheet was filed. It now claims one
22 volume, Volume Kings 2001164, upon which the
23 candidate's name does appear. A copy of that, and
24 they filed the appropriate language, they added

1 April 3, 2020

2 that they're authorized to file the amended cover
3 sheet. We recommend that this be deemed a valid
4 cure.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Approve.

6 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I concur.

7 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, the next is
8 an amended cover sheet filed in response to a
9 March 24th notice of noncompliance regarding the
10 petitions of Thomas Zmich, Libertarian Party
11 candidate for member of the U.S. House of
12 Representatives in the 6th Congressional
13 District. The two defects was one, the cover
14 sheet was attached to the petition and no ID
15 numbers were claimed on the petition. The amended
16 cover sheet then claimed only one volume, not the
17 three listed, but with ID number [unintelligible]
18 [00:44:04] candidate actually appears in that
19 volume, which you have a copy of that volume, and
20 there at the bottom, the certification
21 [unintelligible] [00:44:14] filed amended cover
22 sheet. Our staff recommendation is that this be
23 deemed a valid cure.

24 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I'm just looking

1 April 3, 2020

2 through it. Give me a -- I agree.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: I concur also.

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: If I can ask your
5 indulgence for just one second. I have a person
6 who's physically e-mailed me four times and
7 called twice. Okay. So hopefully, that'll be
8 enough to keep her [unintelligible] [00:45:27].
9 Thank you, you can go back now.

10 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Commissioners, the
11 next relates to the amended cover sheet filed on
12 behalf of, or by Craig Schley, Democrat relating
13 to the 70th Assembly District. The original
14 defect were that the number of volumes claimed in
15 the brief he filed, two cover sheets, volume
16 number one [unintelligible] [00:45:55] two,
17 volume two, volume two. Of those volumes,
18 petition two [unintelligible] [00:46:00]
19 incorrect ID numbers, and what we did is we asked
20 them for an amended. He did file an amended cover
21 sheet, properly claiming the two ID numbers and
22 the two volumes, but the cover sheet now doesn't
23 match the petition. This is matter of getting
24 [unintelligible] [00:46:20] prima facie calendar.

1 April 3, 2020

2 The public office on the designated petition that
3 you have copies of volume 495 and 496 just says
4 New York State 70th Assembly District. On the
5 amended cover sheet, he now puts office of member
6 of the Assembly, 70th AD. I guess his attempt to
7 try to rectify this. But the recommendation is
8 that the public office on the amended cover sheet
9 doesn't match the petition.

10 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: I, I agree and
11 beyond that, when he put in City of New York as
12 well.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Right. I concur,
14 not valid.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. And we will probably
16 see it on the prima facie calendar as well, but
17 commissioners, that, [unintelligible] [00:47:09]
18 that concludes the materials that the staff that
19 has been present were working on have identified
20 as defects and reviewed. So unless you have any
21 further business, I would ask that you make a
22 motion to adjourn and then [unintelligible]
23 [00:47:30].

24 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Mr. Richman,

1 April 3, 2020

2 before we do, I'd like to thank you and the staff
3 for all your hard work during these difficult
4 circumstances in getting this out so that we can
5 perform our statutory responsibilities in this
6 matter.

7 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: With that, and
9 with that in mind, I am happy to adjourn, if we
10 have, if I have, you know, concurrence and I'll
11 e-mail you.

12 MR. RICHMAN: Okay.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Yes, I second
14 Commissioner Zaccone's motion to adjourn.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.
16 Have a good weekend and hopefully, we'll see you
17 and talk to you on Tuesday and for the regular
18 meeting and we'll probably ask for another cover
19 sheet committee meeting on Tuesday. Thank you.

20 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Very good. Stay
21 safe, everybody.

22 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Take care.

23 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Thank you.

24 MR. RAPHAEL SAVINO: Okay, Steve, we're

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

April 3, 2020

going to cut the stream now, okay.


MR. RICHMAN: This should close the meeting and [unintelligible] [00:48:29].

(The meeting concluded at 12:50 p.m.)

CERTIFICATE OF ACCURACY

I, Claudia Marques, certify that the foregoing transcript of the Board of Elections in The City of New York on April 3, 2020 was prepared using the required transcription equipment and is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Certified By



Date: February 2, 2021

GENEVAWORLDWIDE, INC

256 West 38th Street - 10th Floor

New York, NY 10018