

BOARD OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK

COMMISSIONERS' MEETING
AND
COVER SHEET REVIEW

42 Broadway - 6th floor
Commissioners' Hearing Room
New York, NY 10004
March 24, 2020

March 24, 2020

PRESENT:

President Patricia Anne Taylor

Secretary Frederic Umane

Commissioner Jose Araujo

Commissioner Miguelina Camilo

Commissioner Gino Marmorato

Commissioner Michael Michel

Commissioner Simon Shamoun

Commissioner Tiffany Townsend

Commissioner John Wm. Zaccone

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director

Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director

Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager

Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager

Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to Commissioners

Steven Denkberg, Counsel to Commissioners

Steven Richman, General Counsel

Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel

1 March 24, 2020

2 (The meeting commenced.)

3 MR. MICHAEL J. RYAN: Okay. So we're
4 going to do a roll call. Unfortunately, the
5 camera was not rolling, so everyone understands,
6 keep your phone on mute, and I will do the roll
7 call attendance in order of appearance on the
8 letterhead. Commissioner Taylor.

9 PRESIDENT PATRICIA ANNE TAYLOR:
10 Present.

11 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Umame.

12 COMMISSIONER FREDERIC UMANE: Here.

13 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Araujo.

14 COMMISSIONER JOSE ARAUJO: Here.

15 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Camilo.

16 COMMISSIONER MIGUELINA CAMILO: Present.

17 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Marmorato.

18 COMMISSIONER GINO MARMORATO: Here.

19 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Michel.

20 COMMISSIONER MICHAEL MICHEL: Here.

21 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Shamoun.

22 COMMISSIONER SIMON SHAMOUN: Here.

23 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Townsend.

24 COMMISSIONER TIFFANY TOWNSEND: Here.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RYAN: And Commissioner Zaccone.

3 COMMISSIONER JOHN WM. ZACCONE: Present.

4 MR. RYAN: Okay. So, everyone is
5 present.

6 MS. KONTAZMANIS: You want to
7 [unintelligible] [00:01:03]?

8 MR. RYAN: And thank you. Oh, I'm sorry,
9 and remotely Steven Denkberg. Steven Denkberg.

10 MR. STEVEN DENKERG: Here.

11 MR. RYAN: Okay. And Kenneth Moltner.

12 MR. KENNETH MOLTNER: Present. Here.

13 MR. RYAN: Okay. Here for the
14 commissioners are on the telephone, Michael Ryan,
15 executive director, Dawn Sandow, deputy executive
16 director, Pam Perkins, administrative manager,
17 Georgea Kontzamanis, operations manager, Steven
18 Richman, legal, there's too many Stevens, and
19 Raphael Savino, also from legal and we're all
20 present here and the camera is rolling, so that
21 we can capture this according to the governor's
22 regulations.

23 Item, agenda item 1A is pretty
24 straightforward. We'll deal with that

1 March 24, 2020

2 secondarily. This morning, we received a
3 communication from the New York City Law
4 Department. The New York City Law Department is
5 closing its in person service of process and is
6 accepting all lawsuit filings electronically.

7 So again, in keeping with the process
8 that we've established, I'm going to indicate a
9 motion that we want passed and then we can open
10 it for discussion. I will take the meeting roll
11 call and any commissioners that wish to make
12 comment or have any questions can do so when
13 their names are called. So I'll finish that
14 presentation and we'll go through that process.

15 Thereafter, it's a little bit
16 cumbersome, but then we'll have to go through it
17 again so that once the motion is made and for the
18 purposes of these meetings, I will ask that any
19 motions are made by the president and seconded by
20 the secretary so that we can keep that process in
21 order and after that, we'll take the votes
22 accordingly, again starting with president and
23 walking down the list as we've done that.

24 So, what the city Law Department asked

1 March 24, 2020

2 is asking that the Board as an independent agency
3 can make its own determination with respect to
4 service of process. In any event, I will read in
5 its entirety, the guidance that we have received
6 regarding service of process and then I will ask
7 for commentary as discussed.

8 In light of Governor Cuomo's executive
9 order 202.8 totaling the period for the service
10 of process until April 19, 2020, the Law
11 Department has decided to close our agency's
12 service window and instead move to service by e-
13 mail.

14 Below is the text that appears on our
15 internet page. We also plan to put this notice in
16 the New York Law Journal.

17 First, if your own agency regularly
18 accepts service, and maybe interested in doing
19 the same, feel free to model the language below.

20 Second, we would like to make you aware
21 of this information so that you do not refer
22 litigants to the Law Department's service window
23 during this period.

24 And it says, in light of Governor

1 March 24, 2020

2 Cuomo's executive order 202.8, totaling the
3 period for service of process until April 19,
4 2020, the service window for the City of New York
5 located at 100 Church Street, New York, New York
6 is closed. During this period, we have
7 established an e-mail address where the Law
8 Department is now accepting service. The newly
9 established e-mail address for service is
10 serviceecf@law.nyc.gov.

11 So under those circumstances, we could
12 lift that language, replace our particular
13 information in those places where appropriate and
14 also establish an e-mail for the service of
15 process. And my understanding is, and I will have
16 Mr. Richman provide some clarification, is that
17 something similar has been done in the past for
18 other purposes, I believe, that's what he said.
19 So I'm going to ask that question of Mr. Richman.

20 MR. STEVEN RICHMAN: Commissioners,
21 again, in order accommodate the need to limit the
22 amount of in-person contact in our facilities,
23 that's what the Law Department is recommending
24 for both, directing for mayoral agencies, and

1 March 24, 2020

2 recommending for non-mayoral agencies to make the
3 independent judgment.

4 We've had very good success with the
5 creation now in terms of the petition, copying
6 requests, using it through e-mail and processing
7 it that way as well as for the information
8 regarding the ledgers. Given the fact that the
9 last day to commence a proceeding will be next
10 Friday, April 3rd, I strongly recommend we do
11 this. And this would also obviate the need for us
12 to be open until midnight on the last day to
13 commence a proceeding, since we will be taking
14 electronic service, and if it's clocked in on the
15 e-mail by 11:59, that's time we received.

16 So given that fact, and again this would
17 only go through the current executive order,
18 which is April 19th, which precedes our hearings,
19 if it gets extended, that's something else for
20 that process afterwards, but commissioners, I do
21 not see a down side, and especially if we end up
22 having to operate remotely, this way Raphael and
23 myself, and I'd ask Steve Kitlinger of the Law
24 Department be included just as a routine, since

1 March 24, 2020

2 he's operating remotely, we'll get notice as it
3 gets filed. So I would strongly recommend to you
4 commissioners, if you would adopt the
5 recommendation of Mr. Ryan.

6 MR. RYAN: Yes, and that's the
7 recommendation of executive management, and now
8 we will open it up for the commentary/question
9 portion of the meeting, starting with
10 Commissioner Taylor.

11 MS. KONTAZMANIS: It might take a minute
12 to unmute.

13 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Taylor, please
14 unmute if you're responding.

15 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Hello.

16 MR. RYAN: Yes, there you go. So do you
17 have any comments or questions, Commissioner
18 Taylor?

19 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I don't believe I
20 have any questions. I believe that we should move
21 forward in accepting your recommendation and if a
22 motion is required, this is it. [laughter]

23 MR. RYAN: Okay. So then we can suspend
24 the commentary portion of the program and move

1 March 24, 2020

2 on. So Commissioner Umame, did you second that
3 motion?

4 MS. KONTAZMANIS: Yes.

5 SECRETARY UMANE: I did, most
6 respectfully.

7 MR. RYAN: Okay. So we now have a motion
8 on the floor that has been made and seconded. I
9 will go down the roll call for the vote.
10 Commissioner Taylor?

11 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Yes.

12 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Umame?

13 SECRETARY UMANE: Yes.

14 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Araujo?

15 COMMISSIONER ARAUJO: Yes.

16 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Camilo?

17 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Yes.

18 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Marmorato?

19 COMMISSIONER MARMORATO: Yes.

20 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Michel?

21 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yes.

22 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Shamoun?

23 COMMISSIONER SHAMOUN: Yes.

24 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Townsend?

1 March 24, 2020

2 COMMISSIONER TOWNSEND: Yes.

3 MR. RYAN: And Commissioner Zaccone?

4 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Yes.

5 MR. RYAN: Okay. So, that agenda item is
6 now taken care of, and we will move on to the
7 appointment of a cover sheet review committee. I
8 would suggest since Commissioner Michel is here,
9 although I don't want to interfere in
10 commissioner business, but perhaps Commissioner
11 Michel might be the cover sheet review committee
12 for the Republicans and then we would only need a
13 Democrat if that's okay.

14 MR. RICHMAN: On the phone.

15 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Mm-hmm.

16 SECRETARY UMANE: If it's okay with
17 Mike, I so appoint you.

18 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: You got it.

19 MR. RYAN: Alright. And Commissioner
20 Taylor?

21 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I suppose I could
22 appoint myself.

23 MR. RYAN: Okay. And then Mr. Richman is
24 saying that we, as a failsafe should have one

1 March 24, 2020

2 appointed for Friday as well, and this way here,
3 and we'll let you know if there's any work, but
4 have one. There will be, so Commissioner Taylor,
5 would you like to ask of the Democrats who are on
6 the line who would like to be on that call -- on
7 that committee? Or yourself as well.

8 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Would anyone like to
9 appear for Friday?

10 MR. RICHMAN: By phone.

11 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: The Bronx is --

12 COMMISSIONER SHAMOUN: I'm showing I'm
13 available.

14 MR. RYAN: Okay. So we have Commissioner
15 Camilo and Commissioner Shamoun, if that meets
16 the approval of the president and secretary.

17 SECRETARY UMANE: Yes.

18 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I approve.

19 SECRETARY UMANE: Of course, thank you.

20 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, we're going
21 to try to do it just about 1:30 because we're
22 going to try to get this done and get letters out
23 that day as well.

24 SECRETARY UMANE: Yes.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: We'll send each of you an
3 e-mail and get you to confirm it, but it's a slow
4 process, slower than normal because of the
5 limited staff here, but I regret to advise you, I
6 think we will have business on Friday.

7 MS. KONTAZMANIS: That's Commissioner
8 Camilo?

9 MR. RYAN: Camilo.

10 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: 1:30?

11 MS. SANDOW: Yes.

12 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I do have a
13 [unintelligible] [00:11:09].

14 MR. RYAN: I'm sorry, Commissioner
15 Taylor, you got stepped on a little bit verbally.
16 Go ahead.

17 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I just had a question
18 whether or not I need to be able to do this,
19 [unintelligible] [00:11:24] review committee work
20 by Webex?

21 MR. RICHMAN: No, doing it by phone.

22 MR. RYAN: No, phone is fine under these
23 circumstances, until the executive order that
24 gets lifted that's allowing us to function in

1 March 24, 2020

2 this way. Under ordinary circumstances, if you
3 were doing it remotely, yes, Commissioner Taylor,
4 you are 100 percent right, Webex and recorded,
5 but under these circumstances, faces are no
6 longer required to be visible until the governor
7 changes that regulation.

8 SECRETARY UMANE: Yeah, but how can she
9 see? How can she see?

10 MR. RICHMAN: Well, we have to get the
11 documents to her.

12 SECRETARY UMANE: Do you mail the
13 documents to her?

14 MR. RICHMAN: Well, we didn't do that
15 commissioners, but I think we could describe it
16 to you, because most of them are page numbering
17 defects because we haven't, we wanted to do it
18 this afternoon because the sheer volume of making
19 copies of the petition pages, those were --

20 SECRETARY UMANE: Can you e-mail the
21 documents ahead of time --

22 MS. SANDOW: Yeah.

23 SECRETARY UMANE: -- with arrows
24 indicating --

1 March 24, 2020

2 MS. SANDOW: Mm-hmm.

3 SECRETARY UMANE: -- arrows with letters
4 or numbers indicating what you're --

5 MS. KONTAZMANIS: It's thousands of
6 pages of documents.

7 SECRETARY UMANE: -- asking us about.

8 MS. KONTAZMANIS: There are thousands of
9 pages of documents.

10 SECRETARY UMANE: You know, Item A on
11 the cover sheet.

12 MS. KONTAZMANIS: Then maybe the way --

13 [CROSSTALK]

14 SECRETARY UMANE: Could be on the
15 [unintelligible] [00:12:28] e-mail.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, we'll e-
17 mail you -- but commissioners, especially in some
18 of the petition rounds, we're talking about
19 hundreds of pages without page numbers.

20 MS. KONTAZMANIS: Right, so maybe the
21 way best --

22 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Is this for Friday
23 as well?

24 MR. RICHMAN: That's what we've --

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RYAN: Yes.

3 MS. KONTAZMANIS: Maybe Webex is better
4 Friday then.

5 MS. SANDOW: Webex is better then.

6 MR. RYAN: Alright. So we'll try to spin
7 up a Webex for Friday, assuming that we should be
8 able to do that. Obviously, on the notice today,
9 we would not be able to do that, but I think that
10 legal should be able to provide with
11 particularity --

12 MR. RICHMAN: Yes.

13 MR. RYAN: -- you know, those situations
14 and commissioner --

15 MR. RICHMAN: And Michel can do it
16 Friday.

17 MR. RYAN: Commissioner Shamel --

18 MR. RICHMAN: [unintelligible]

19 [00:13:03] [laughter]

20 MR. RYAN: -- Commissioner Michel is
21 here and he can verify what the, what's going on
22 to Commissioner Taylor for today.

23 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Okay. I also am
24 watching, so if push comes to shove, you could --

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: We could hold it up to the
3 camera.

4 MR. RICHMAN: Then we will show it up
5 commissioner.

6 MR. RYAN: Alright.

7 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: So, yeah. that
8 [unintelligible] [00:13:26].

9 MR. RYAN: Should we do a collective
10 wave or we good?

11 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: What do they do at
12 the baseball game? [laughter]

13 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: That's okay, thank
14 you.

15 MR. RYAN: Alright. So, that, not that
16 that action has been taken by the executive, I
17 don't have any indication that there is any
18 personnel for today and there's no indication
19 that there's any litigation today. So we are not
20 requiring from executive management's
21 perspective, an executive session. So I would
22 just then ask the president and secretary whether
23 executive session is required today or entertain
24 a motion to adjourn the meeting and set a new

1 March 24, 2020

2 meeting date. Commissioner Taylor?

3 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Not on my behalf, but
4 I think that we should ask the other
5 commissioners and not just Fred and me.

6 MR. RYAN: Okay. So Commissioner Umane.

7 SECRETARY UMANE: Yes.

8 MR. RYAN: Yes, you want an executive
9 session?

10 SECRETARY UMANE: [unintelligible]
11 [00:14:37] don't have anything other than just an
12 update as to where we stand vis-à-vis the April
13 28th elections.

14 [CROSSTALK]

15 SECRETARY UMANE: [unintelligible]
16 [00:14:53] so perhaps a [unintelligible]
17 [00:14:54] is better.

18 MR. RYAN: Right. So I can answer that
19 straightforwardly. We have no indication to this
20 point that there has been any modification to the
21 April 28th election schedule.

22 SECRETARY UMANE: Okay.

23 MR. RYAN: Alright. So --

24 COMMISSIONER ARAUJO: Are you hearing

1 March 24, 2020

2 anything at all?

3 MS. KONTAZMANIS: Discussion are going
4 on.

5 MR. RYAN: We're hearing, I mean we're
6 hearing the same, pretty much echoing what's out
7 there publicly. That there are ongoing
8 discussions and that there was a reporter Zack
9 Fink that asked the governor directly today a
10 question and he said that he had not thought
11 about it to this point. I suspect that his staff
12 is working on some type of plans and there's
13 ongoing discussions with the state legislature,
14 as well as they may have some ability
15 statutorily.

16 Now, I did forward an e-mail, I believe
17 it was yesterday, Assemblyman Dinowitz did put
18 out at least one bill that I'm aware of regarding
19 movement of the date from the 28th of April to
20 the 23rd of June, we don't have any further
21 update as to whether or not there's a Senate same
22 as, at least I don't, does anybody else? No one
23 else has any update on that and we don't
24 presently know whether or not there is some broad

1 March 24, 2020

2 or unanimous support for that moving forward
3 amongst his colleagues in the Assembly and/or the
4 leadership of the Assembly. So, we're all in that
5 same holding pattern. Life has been reduced to
6 minute by minute, hour by hour.

7 MS. KONTAZMANIS: And they may be going
8 back into session on Thursday. [unintelligible]
9 [00:16:45].

10 MR. RYAN: The only thing that we're
11 hearing is that the state legislature may be
12 going back into session on Thursday. It's not
13 confirmed, it should be midday. I'd presume that
14 a large chunk of their responsibilities is going
15 to be the budget and the continued conversations
16 with respect to the budget as April 1st is a date
17 that is rapidly approaching and that's the date
18 that the state budget is supposed to be in place.

19 MS. KONTAZMANIS: And they're putting a
20 plan together today so their offices can start to
21 [unintelligible] [00:17:16].

22 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: You sent a letter
23 already?

24 MR. RYAN: Right. Pardon?

1 March 24, 2020

2 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: You sent the
3 letter?

4 MR. RYAN: Oh, the letter from the
5 commissioners?

6 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yeah.

7 MR. RYAN: Yes. The letter that was
8 discussed last week from the commissioners
9 regarding the postponement of this election from
10 April 28th to June 23rd was sent. And it was sent
11 not only to the governor by e-mail, but also by
12 regular mail, as well as the, as the mayor of the
13 City of New York and the leadership of both
14 governments, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, Senate
15 Majority Leader Cousins on the Senate side and
16 Speaker Hastie on the Assembly side, and then
17 also Corey Johnson, Speaker of the City Council.
18 So, and also the State Board of Elections.

19 So that information is out there, and
20 I'm sure being considered, as well as it
21 dovetails with the Election Commissioners
22 Association press release that was forwarded to
23 you all yesterday, but published today regarding
24 three things. It was the postponement of the

1 March 24, 2020

2 election, it was relaxing of the absentee, and
3 then what was the third?

4 MR. RICHMAN: Flexibility in the
5 assignment of poll sites and EDs and
6 notwithstanding the current statutory limits.

7 MR. RYAN: Right, so that was worth
8 noting for public consumption, a bipartisan
9 recommendation made by both the Republican and
10 the Democratic commissioners on the Election
11 Commissioners Association. They coalesced around
12 that. There was a series of caucus phone calls. I
13 know that the ECA did a lot of work to formulate
14 positions and make the best guidance that they
15 can do under the circumstances and now it is up
16 to others to make those decisions.

17 In the meantime, we are the passive
18 recipients of all of that information. We're not
19 actively participating in the process, only to
20 the extent of if we're asked information, we
21 provide that information and information is being
22 provided to the State Board of Elections as well
23 as any elected officials that reach out. I can
24 tell you there is no organized effort in that

1 March 24, 2020

2 regard. It is happening on a minute by minute
3 kind of ad hoc basis, but as we're asked, we
4 provided information.

5 MS. SANDOW: And give them an update,
6 two days that our staff were here, taking all
7 petitions.

8 MR. RYAN: And yes, Ms. Sandow is
9 correct. I think, and the commissioners know
10 this, but I believe that it's good to say it out
11 loud for anybody who's watching it by Webex or
12 might watch it at a later date. We have done the
13 responsible work of social distancing and staff
14 reductions as we were required to do under the
15 governor's 50 percent reduction of on-site staff
16 rule and the work from home provisions and such.

17 But there is a chunk of our work that
18 cannot be done elsewhere. It can only be done
19 here. And I would like to commend numbers, dozens
20 of our staff members, if not several hundred,
21 that have participated in the process of
22 completing the petitions. And we remained open
23 until midnight on Friday. There was staff here
24 all weekend. We were open until midnight on

1 March 24, 2020

2 Monday night to make --

3 MS. SANDOW: Tonight too.

4 MR. RYAN: They'll be open until
5 midnight again tonight.

6 MS. SANDOW: Thursday and Friday.

7 MR. RYAN: And, and the remainder of the
8 week as scheduled. I don't have all of the dates
9 off the top of my head. But the point that I
10 would like to make is let's assume that we all
11 get through this and we're in a position in June
12 to conduct an election. The work that the staff
13 is doing now is essential for the Board's ability
14 to be able to conduct an election in June if
15 things get back to normal, right.

16 And it cannot be overstated, the
17 dedication and the remarkable ability of our
18 staff to be able to come in, to put their
19 personal considerations off to the side, to put
20 their family considerations off to the side, and
21 to work hours upon hours to make sure that we
22 have a democracy to come back to when the time
23 comes back that this terrible thing passes and we
24 can get back to whatever normal means in those

1 March 24, 2020

2 days, right.

3 MS. SANDOW: [unintelligible]

4 [00:22:20].

5 MR. RYAN: And as well the public coming
6 in and all of that, and in the face of all that
7 uncertainty and fear that everybody else has and
8 our staff is putting that uncertainty and fear
9 off to the side to make sure that this important
10 aspect of our way of life will remain intact
11 whenever the time comes that the society starts
12 to begin to function like we're used to. So they
13 deserve all of the credit in the world. And, you
14 know, it's --

15 MS. SANDOW: And the borough staff as
16 well, as the borough offices are moving along
17 with 50 percent less staff and they're getting
18 the job done. They received over 30,000
19 registrations that had to go into the system. And
20 they stayed and made sure every single borough,
21 that they got them processed and into the system
22 on time.

23 MR. RYAN: And we're also off schedule a
24 bit, to say the least [laughter] with respect to

1 March 24, 2020

2 the preparations for the April 28th primary, but
3 we don't have an answer yet so we have to take
4 the steps as if this process is going to move
5 forward. So we have a new, revised schedule in
6 place to print the ballots for the Staten Island,
7 the Bronx and Manhattan and get -- I should say
8 to build the ballots for those boroughs, not
9 print, so that that work is out of the way. I
10 have pushed Brooklyn and Queens to the backside
11 of this process because we remain awaiting an
12 answer on whether there will be a special
13 election joined with the April 28th primary in
14 Brooklyn, in the 37th CD, and then we also are
15 waiting an answer on the Queens borough president
16 special, which has been postponed indefinitely
17 and no new date set. And then there is, is it the
18 36th?

19 MR. RICHMAN: 31st.

20 MR. RYAN: 31st Assembly District in
21 Queens I think, Assemblyperson Titus became a
22 judge and now there's a vacancy there. So now we
23 have two definite specials, one in Queens, one in
24 Brooklyn, one maybe special, which is in Queens,

1 March 24, 2020

2 that becomes a bit more vexing in the sense that
3 it's a borough wide special, which would create
4 its own set of challenges. But in any event,
5 we're making our plans and we're continuing to
6 move forward until folks tell us not to.

7 Alright. That is all I have. And I will
8 say off camera, I was getting the line across the
9 neck from Commissioner Michel, so I think he
10 might have been scratching his collar. [laughter]

11 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I'm exercising my
12 throat.

13 MR. RYAN: I didn't have a career in
14 television but it looks like I was getting a
15 directive. So in any event, that's what we have
16 up to this point and we don't have anything
17 further for executive session. So if -- I can
18 continue to go down the list then and ask if
19 everyone's all right, or otherwise, I'll
20 entertain a motion to adjourn with a new adjourn
21 date. Commissioner Taylor, what is your
22 preference? Do you wish that I poll the rest of
23 the commissioners regarding further commentary?

24 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: If there is a

1 March 24, 2020

2 commissioner that has commentary, would that
3 person kindly speak up?

4 MR. RYAN: Perfect.

5 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Being none.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Hearing none.

7 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I make a motion to
8 adjourn. Before making that motion, I would like
9 to second your commendation of our wonderful
10 Board of Election staff, and also to thank you,
11 Executive Director Ryan and Deputy Executive
12 Director Sandow for your leadership and all of
13 the executive management staff, because without
14 your leadership, we would not be where we are.
15 And people who are working who are not in this
16 picture would not be able to be doing what
17 they're doing, so thank you.

18 MS. SANDOW: You're welcome.

19 MR. RYAN: Thank you very much. Alright.
20 So motion to adjourn?

21 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I make a motion to
22 adjourn.

23 SECRETARY UMANE: Second.

24 MR. RYAN: Okay. And all in favor? You

1 March 24, 2020

2 can shout it out, just let it rip.

3 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Aye.

4 SECRETARY UMANE: Aye.

5 COMMISSIONER ARAUJO: Aye.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMILO: Aye.

7 COMMISSIONER MARMORATO: Aye.

8 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Aye.

9 COMMISSIONER SHAMOUN: Aye.

10 COMMISSIONER TOWNSEND: Aye.

11 COMMISSIONER ZACCONE: Aye.

12 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: The eyes have it.

13 MR. RYAN: That sounds like a unanimous
14 vote to me. And then if that's the case, I would
15 then ask all of the commissioners with the
16 exception of Commissioner Taylor to just hang up
17 from this call so that the cover sheet review can
18 be done.

19 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Thank you everyone.

20 MR. RYAN: Thank you.

21 [OFF THE RECORD]

22 [ON THE RECORD]

23 MR. RICHMAN: This is the commissioner's
24 cover sheet review committee being held on, being

1 March 24, 2020

2 held on Tuesday, March 24th, pursuant to the
3 governor's executive order, President Taylor, the
4 Democratic commissioner from Staten Island is
5 participating via teleconference and watching the
6 proceedings on video. Commissioner Michael
7 Michel, the Queens Republican is also present.
8 Commissioners, we have three sets of matters to
9 present to you. One, the basic defects that have
10 been identified so far, the second category
11 relates to page numbering defects and the third
12 category relates to printers errors and letters
13 that have been submitted for petitions filed.

14 First, Brooklyn, Democratic Party cover
15 sheet for Rick Echevarria, 37th City Council
16 District special election. Mr. Echevarria
17 submitted a cover sheet claiming one volume, but
18 he did not include the volume ID number on the
19 cover sheet. That is a curable defect. We
20 recommend a notice go out to have him correct the
21 defect. So, Commissioner Taylor, with your
22 permission, I'll have Commissioner Michel vote
23 first in person.

24 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: And then we'll enter you
3 on the record. Commissioner Michel?

4 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

5 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioner Taylor, can
6 you see the cover sheet?

7 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Yes.

8 MR. RICHMAN: And what's circled in red
9 is what's missing.

10 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I agree.

11 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Okay. So what do I
12 do?

13 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. So you're going to -
14 - Queens Republicans.

15 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Queens.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Yes. And I will put in a
17 mark on behalf of Commissioner Taylor for Staten
18 Island Dems, that it's just been approved.

19 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Thank you, yes.

20 MR. RICHMAN: Second matter, this
21 relates to two candidates for the Democratic
22 County Committee in the Bronx. On the County
23 Committee schedule in the 55th Election District
24 in the 87th Assembly District, candidate Sharif

1 March 24, 2020
2 Islam [phonetic] and Abdumen Rahman [phonetic],
3 they claim the volume numbers, but they don't put
4 the page numbers in but they claim a sufficient
5 number of signatures. Commissioner, like the
6 others, there should be a page number inserted in
7 the schedule. That's the defect, Commissioner
8 Michel as well. So what we would do is send a
9 notice to them telling them they have to file an
10 amended schedule for those two candidates,
11 setting forth the page numbers where their
12 signatures appear.

13 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

14 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioner Taylor?

15 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also agree, yes.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Thank you. That's
17 number two. Okay.

18 MR. SAVINO: Want to pass them over --

19 MR. RICHMAN: No, just leave them.

20 MR. SAVINO: Okay. That makes sense.

21 MR. RICHMAN: The third one, for the
22 following candidates in Queens County Democratic
23 Party, Everly D. Brown, for member of the
24 Assembly in the 29th Assembly District, Rista

1 March 24, 2020

2 Henson [phonetic] State Senator, 14th Senatorial
3 District, Asim Deen, male member of the
4 Democratic State Committee, 29th AD and Shutay
5 Brown [phonetic] female member of the Democratic
6 State Committee of the 25th ED, they followed the
7 cover sheet, claiming two volumes of putting
8 forth the volume numbers. What is missing is the
9 failure to state the claim that's on every other
10 cover sheet that this petition contains a
11 sufficient amount of signatures to qualify for
12 the ballot.

13 Again, this is a curable defect for the
14 candidates and the recommendation is we send a
15 notice to the candidates, since there is no
16 contact person, the four letters will go out
17 telling them that if they want to remain on the
18 ballot, they have to file an amended cover sheet
19 including the claim of a sufficient number of
20 signatures.

21 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: So I agree. This
22 goes to the candidate now?

23 MR. RICHMAN: Because there's no contact
24 person on the cover sheet.

1 March 24, 2020

2 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: So there will be
3 four letters?

4 MR. RICHMAN: Four letters, yes, one to
5 each individual.

6 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

7 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioner Michel,
8 Commissioner Taylor.

9 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: So is it going to one
10 contact person?

11 MR. RICHMAN: No, commissioner. If you
12 look at the cover sheet, there is no contact
13 person listed. So in the absence --

14 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: So it has to go to
15 each of those --

16 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Correct.

17 MR. RICHMAN: It'll go to the four
18 candidates individually. So each one --

19 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Alright. I agree.

20 MR. RICHMAN: -- would get, each one
21 would get notice. So was that a yes,
22 commissioner?

23 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: She said, I agree.

24 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Yes.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Sorry. Libertarian
3 Party, Queens County, for the following
4 candidates. Thomas Zmich for member of the House
5 of Representatives 6th District and for Michael
6 Arcati, member of the -- these are all for the
7 Libertarian Party judicial district delegates,
8 two candidates, Michael Arcati and Gabrielle
9 Cordova and Michael Arcati again, for New York
10 State Assembly 28th District and Irwin Mark
11 Weinblatt for Libertarian Party Judicial state,
12 Libertarian state committee members. I should say
13 these are all for state committee members and the
14 Assembly. In both cover sheets, commissioner, for
15 the Senate congressional candidate that claimed
16 three petition volumes, but no ID numbers are
17 lifted in the cover sheet for the three members
18 of the state committee of the Libertarian Party
19 and State assembly. They claim six volumes in the
20 petition, but no ID numbers listed. A contact
21 person is listed, so the notice will go out to
22 the contact person for both cover sheets to be
23 cured, and as we said, the ID number's not listed
24 on the cover sheet in accordance with rule CD-2.

1 March 24, 2020

2 Oh, in addition, you can see where they're
3 attached. The cover sheet was attached to the
4 petition volume in violation of rule C1, we would
5 tell them to file the amended cover sheet
6 separately, so --

7 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: So they're all
8 curable?

9 MR. RICHMAN: They're all curable
10 defects.

11 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yes.

12 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I vote yes on your
13 recommendation.

14 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioner,
15 that's another yes. And then Queens County,
16 Democratic Party, member of the Assembly 31st
17 Assembly District, Derrick DeFlorimonte, again,
18 the similar issue here. They filed the cover
19 sheet, but the cover sheet left the area for
20 identification numbers blank, no petition numbers
21 included, which is noted in the staff finding
22 here. The recommendation again is to have a NCN
23 notice go out and give them the three business
24 days to cure the defect.

1 March 24, 2020

2 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yes.

3 PRESIDENT TAYLOR:

4 I also agree, yes.

5 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. I see it. And
6 the last standard one is Khaleel M. Anderson for
7 male member of the Democratic State Committee. In
8 the one petition volume, he claims on his cover
9 sheet, his cover sheet claims that the two
10 offices, he's running both for member of the
11 Assembly from the 31st District and male member
12 of the Democratic State Committee. You can see
13 both positions listed for the public office and
14 party position for the candidate, one volume and
15 the ID number. But however, the actual petition
16 only has him for member of the Assembly. So the
17 defect would be that the candidate does not
18 appear for the party position on the volume
19 claimed, Volume 46-, Queens 2000468, so he'd have
20 to file an amended cover sheet just claiming --

21 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right.

22 MR. RICHMAN: Either he may have had
23 another volume or correcting it.

24 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: No, he can't. But

1 March 24, 2020

2 he can't. He can only claim this.

3 MR. RICHMAN: There may be another
4 volume.

5 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Oh, yes, volume.

6 MR. RICHMAN: That the volume number
7 listed for male member of the State Committee, he
8 doesn't appear for what he's claiming. We,
9 commissioners, we haven't gotten to the point to
10 see what else has been filed.

11 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right, right.

12 MR. RICHMAN: So again, he should know
13 what has his name on it.

14 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right. So this is
15 just the cover sheet?

16 MR. RICHMAN: This is a cover sheet
17 defect relating only to the male member of the
18 Democratic state committee.

19 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right.

20 MR. RICHMAN: It does not affect his
21 Assembly candidacy.

22 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

23 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I vote yes.

24 MR. RICHMAN: Okay. Okay. Now, we'll

1 March 24, 2020

2 move to the page numbering defects. Again, thanks
3 to the staff as they processed the petitions that
4 came in, they've been reporting in regularly.
5 Now, I want to state in the beginning, each of
6 these cover sheet defects in the actual petition
7 volumes were examined by a bipartisan team in
8 most cases, including Deputy General Counsel
9 Savino, in most cases, I think even Nick Zamiti
10 [phonetic] or --

11 MR. SAVINO: Or even when I didn't sign
12 off them, I was there watching the team.

13 MR. RICHMAN: Yeah, okay. So we're going
14 to present and we'll put it in. These, the
15 following candidates, in Queens petition volume
16 2000408, candidate Anthony Miranda for borough
17 president, Democratic Party, John J. Cifone for
18 judge of the civil court, Oster Bryan for member
19 of the Assembly in the 33rd Assembly District,
20 Robert Williams, Assembly District leader, 33rd
21 Assembly District Part A, and the 33rd AD slate
22 for delegates beginning with Philip Hollen
23 [phonetic] the entire petition volume had no page
24 numbers.

1 March 24, 2020

2 It is curable under the court decisions
3 of the Third and Fourth Departments, a notice
4 goes out to the candid- or the contact person. In
5 this case, it will be the contact person, since
6 fortunately, at least cover sheets were filed,
7 advising them to order a copy of the petition and
8 in the exact order, it was keeping it in the
9 exact order filed, inscribing on the copy any
10 omissions or corrections to the error. So for
11 Volume 408, this is the first defect.

12 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I vote yes on the
13 recommendation of the bipartisan group that
14 reviewed it.

15 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I vote yes also.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Now, similarly on several
17 petitions --

18 MR. SAVINO: There's three of them --

19 MR. RICHMAN: -- there are three of
20 them. For Queens Volume QN 2000411, are
21 candidates Miranda for borough president and
22 Cifone appear again. Also the State Senate
23 candidate, Diana Sanchez, the 34th Assembly
24 District candidates, for the Assembly, Angel

1 March 24, 2020

2 Cruz, for male district leader, Luis Gomez, for
3 female district leader Liliana Melo, female
4 member of the state committee, Stephanie
5 Gonzalez, male member of the Democratic State
6 Committee Daniel Quintero, and the delegates to
7 the judicial convention for the 34th Assembly
8 District, beginning with Hiram Monserrate, again
9 the entire volume of the petitions is pa- is not
10 numbered. So we want to recommend again giving
11 them the same cure.

12 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree on the
13 recommendation of the bipartisan group.

14 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also agree on the
15 recommendation of the bipartisan group.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. And lastly,
17 Volume Queens 2000410, candidates, exactly the
18 same candidates, it's the second volume relating
19 to the 34th Assembly District plus the candidates
20 for borough president, civil court and the State
21 Senate district, no page numbers throughout the
22 entire volume.

23 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I vote yes on the
24 bipartisan recommendation.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: And commissioners, the
3 staff will be fortunate that all of the cover
4 sheets for each of the candidates named on all
5 three petition volumes all goes to Mr. Angel
6 Cruz, esquire, so at least administratively, our
7 work is made a little easier.

8 MR. SAVINO: Did Commissioner Taylor
9 vocally say --

10 MR. RICHMAN: Oh, no. Commissioner, on
11 the third one, did you vote?

12 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I did not, but I do
13 now vote yes.

14 MR. SAVINO: Thank you, commissioner.

15 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, Mr. Savino.

16 MR. SAVINO: You're welcome.

17 MR. RICHMAN: Next one, Queens,
18 Democratic petition 200786, Miriam J. Bensman,
19 candidate for the Democratic County Committee in
20 the 13th ED of the 28th AD, commissioners, it is
21 a three page petition. I'm exhibiting you copy
22 page one, there is no sheet number at the bottom,
23 and the, according to the bipartisan team, the
24 other two pages are similar situated. So again,

1 March 24, 2020

2 we give them the opportunity to correct this
3 petition for the county committee candidate.

4 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree on the
5 bipartisan recommendation.

6 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also agree on the
7 bipartisan recommendation.

8 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioner, wrong box.
9 Just momentarily, I think Commissioner Michel
10 became a Democrat.

11 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I became a
12 Democrat. I signed in the wrong box. [laughter]

13 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: We'll take any
14 [unintelligible] [00:42:02].

15 MR. SAVINO: Don't take our
16 commissioner.

17 MR. RICHMAN: Democratic petition, Kings
18 County, Volume 257, for candidates in the 51st
19 Assembly District, Felix Ortiz, for both male
20 member of the state committee and member of the
21 Assembly, Arelis Martinez for female member of
22 the Democratic State Committee, the candidate
23 slate for delegations at the convention beginning
24 by, led by Nancy Padilla and the alternates by

1 March 24, 2020

2 Eddie [unintelligible] [00:42:30] and for
3 Tremaine S. Wright, candidate for the State
4 Senate in the 25th Senate District.

5 Commissioners, the defect here is that there are
6 two page numbers 101 and four pages numbered 136.
7 So again, I think in the numbering, it looks like
8 there was an inadvertent errors, we'll give them
9 notice to cure. And again, we're fortunate. In
10 this case, there are only two contact persons for
11 all the candidates involved, so it'll be an easy,
12 relatively easy staff job. The recommendation is
13 to issue a notice.

14 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree with the
15 bipartisan recommendation. And one of the things
16 is you've got to realize they were also rushed to
17 get this done.

18 MR. RICHMAN: Oh, yeah.

19 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Of course, they
20 only had three days.

21 MR. RICHMAN: Well, they had less -- the
22 governor signed the bill on Wednesday evening at
23 about 6:00 p.m.

24 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: Filing began on --

3 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Thursday.

4 MR. RICHMAN: -- 9:00 a.m. on Thursday
5 morning.

6 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: So, you know,
7 we've got to expect that. Like I say, I don't
8 mind all this where they're all curable. It's the
9 one that I'm concerned that aren't curable. Those
10 are the ones that are going to be -- but you
11 don't have any of them.

12 MR. RICHMAN: No.

13 MR. SAVINO: No.

14 MR. RICHMAN: These are all curable.

15 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: So they're easy to
16 vote for.

17 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioner Taylor, your
18 vote please.

19 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I do vote yes.

20 MR. RICHMAN: Okay.

21 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: Recommendation.

22 MR. RICHMAN: Bronx Republicans,
23 petition volumes 323 and 324, the candidates are
24 Dustin Martinez for member of the State Senate

1 March 24, 2020
2 33rd District, Lorraine E. Zeigler, member of the
3 Assembly 86th Assembly District, Ernest Cabrew
4 [phonetic] and Dustin Martinez as delegate and
5 alternate, respectively from the 86th AD, John
6 Colesanti, member of the Assembly for the 80th
7 AD, Steve Dematas [phonetic] and Emil, Linda
8 Pagano [phonetic] delegates for the 80th AD to
9 the judicial convention, Juan Carlos Blanco
10 [phonetic] and Evelyn Dooley Picoli [phonetic] as
11 alternate delegates to the convention. Again, and
12 I think Commissioner Michel's authentication of
13 these two volumes, not page numbers whatsoever in
14 the volumes. And again, these were filed, came in
15 on Friday night, so I think commissioner, your
16 assumption is probably correct.

17 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: They rushed, they
18 rushed it, you know.

19 MR. RICHMAN: So we're recommending that
20 the cure notices go out and give them the chance
21 to cure the defect.

22 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I vote yes on the
23 bipartisan recommendation. Yeah, that's right, I
24 mean that happens.

1 March 24, 2020

2 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also vote yes on
3 the bipartisan recommendation.

4 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. Okay.
5 Democratic petition number Bronx 2000167 for
6 candidate James Hierro for member of the Assembly
7 in the 81st district. In the Assembly, the
8 petition volume, he omitted -- it's missing page
9 25. It goes from page 24 to 26.

10 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree with the
11 bipartisan's recommendation.

12 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: The recommendation is
13 that he'll have an opportunity to cure?

14 MR. RICHMAN: Yes, commissioners, in
15 fact renumber the pages in correct sequential
16 order.

17 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also vote yes.

18 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. Democratic
19 Party Queens County, candidate again is Alka
20 Mansukhani for female member of the Democratic
21 County Committee from the 75th ED and the 37th
22 Assembly District. The finding of the bipartisan
23 team is that pages three and four are out of
24 sequential order. It appears to be one, two,

1 March 24, 2020

2 four, three when they put it together.

3 MR. SAVINO: That's what it was.

4 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yeah, rushing to
5 get it done, so I agree.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Recommended a cure notice
7 go out.

8 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree with the
9 bipartisan. And that's what I'm saying is I think
10 everything in order, and then I'll say
11 nonetheless --

12 MR. SAVINO: Right.

13 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: -- I ran out of
14 time.

15 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also agree.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Okay.

17 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: When they sent me
18 a letter.

19 MR. RICHMAN: Dem- New York County
20 Democratic County Petition NY2000224 for a series
21 of candidates Adriano Espaillat for member of
22 Congress in the 13th Congressional District,
23 Brian Benjamin, State Senator from the 30th
24 Senate District, Daniel J. O'Donnell, member of

1 March 24, 2020
2 the Assembly, 69th Assembly District, Lynn
3 Thomas, female member, Daniel M. Cohen, male
4 member of the Democratic State Committee in the
5 69th Assembly District and the delegates and
6 alternate delegates to the Democratic Convention
7 from the 69th Assembly District beginning with
8 Pablo Zevallos on the delegates, Merle McEldowney
9 [phonetic] on the alternates and three judicial
10 candidate for judge of the civil court vacancy
11 number six, Leticia Ramirez, for vacancy number
12 seven, David Cohen, and vacancy number eight,
13 Michael Katz. The entire petition volume and it
14 should be noted that all the candidates are
15 claiming multiple petition volumes. This is only
16 one of their volumes for each of the candidates,
17 volume number 244, no page numbers throughout the
18 petitions.

19 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: And they have
20 somebody it's going to --

21 MR. RICHMAN: There's a contact person -
22 -

23 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: -- on site?

24 MR. RICHMAN: -- yes, respectively,

1 March 24, 2020

2 yeah, one, two, three, four different people for
3 depending on the offices. All the judges have the
4 same contact number, all the Assembly District
5 people have the same number, and a contact person
6 for the congressional candidate and the
7 senatorial candidate.

8 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: And we're sending
9 it out to all of them?

10 MR. RICHMAN: We're going to give all
11 four of them the chance to cure.

12 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Okay. I agree on
13 the recommendation from the bipartisan group.

14 MR. SAVINO: Commissioner Taylor?

15 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also agree.

16 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you.

17 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: On the recommendation
18 of the bipartisan group.

19 MR. RICHMAN: Democratic New York County
20 Petition Volume 2000275, again, the candidate is
21 Lindsey Boylan, candidate for member of Congress
22 in the 10th Congressional. She filed two volumes,
23 only one is involved here, volume 275, she made a
24 page numbering error. We have page 80 in the

1 March 24, 2020

2 volume, a blank page and then page 81.

3 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Okay.

4 MR. RICHMAN: So again, we're
5 recommending, Mr. Savino and Mr. Zamiti were the
6 review team. We're recommending that a cure
7 notice be issued.

8 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I vote yes on that
9 recommendation by the bipartisan team.

10 MR. SAVINO: If they had caught it, they
11 could just turn that page --

12 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Hmm?

13 MR. SAVINO: If they had caught it, they
14 could have just turned that page around.

15 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yeah.

16 MR. SAVINO: But it was already bound.

17 MR. RICHMAN: Madam President?

18 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also vote yes on
19 the recommendation of the bipartisan committee.

20 MR. RICHMAN: And the final page
21 numbering defect is a Republican petition from
22 Queens.

23 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: What?

24 MR. RICHMAN: Queens 2000784, the

1 March 24, 2020

2 candidate is Scherie S. Murray for member of the
3 House of Representatives from the 14th
4 Congressional District [phone ringing]. Excuse
5 me, commissioners. The page number defect, number
6 one, page 18, a blank page, and then page 19.
7 Page -- number two, 186 to 218, and then it skips
8 a page, and then goes, skips from 235 back to
9 187, and 217 jumps to 236. I think based on
10 Commissioner Michel's comment in putting it
11 together, it was a rush job.

12 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yeah.

13 MR. RICHMAN: And to the extent that it
14 helps the materials were filed on Friday, the
15 last day. So again, commissioners, we're
16 recommending that the notice go out to the
17 candidate who happens to be the contact person,
18 asking her to correct it.

19 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Was that Scherie?

20 MR. RICHMAN: Yes.

21 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yes, I agree. I
22 vote yes on the bipartisan recommendation.

23 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also vote yes on
24 the bipartisan recommendation.

1 March 24, 2020

2 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.
3 Commissioners, and then the last group are
4 several printers errors letters, which at least
5 upon staff review appear to address minor
6 typographical errors in the petitions. Okay. The
7 first relates to Kings County Petition Number
8 200794. This is one of two volumes filed for what
9 should be Bilal, B-I-L-A-L A. Malik, as a
10 candidate for the member of the Democratic State
11 Committee from the 55th Assembly District. Beat
12 the Clock Printing says on the volume we have in
13 front of you, 794, there is a misspelling of his
14 first name. There's an extra A instead of the I.
15 He is the only Malik registered at that address
16 beginning with the letter B and the name is
17 properly spelled on the committee to fill
18 vacancies of his middle name. We have a letter
19 signed by the printer that due to a technical
20 error, Mr. Malik's name was spelled wrong on his
21 petition. It was spelled Balal Malik, then a new
22 petition was reprinted with the correct name,
23 which is in his other volume. So, with respect to
24 this volume, commissioners, based on past

1 March 24, 2020

2 precedent, this appears to be no possibility of
3 confusion, particularly with the name properly
4 spelled as the first named person on the
5 committee to fill vacancies. We recommend that
6 the commissioner accept this printer's error
7 letter and deem this a nominal defect.

8 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

9 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I also agree.

10 MR. RICHMAN: And commissioner agrees,
11 today is 3/24/20. Commissioners, the second
12 printer's error letter comes from David Ryan, who
13 printed the, prepared the conservative party
14 petition for members of the State Committee of
15 the Conservative Party from the 10th
16 Congressional District. In volume 486, they
17 misspelled the name of, the first name of
18 Candidate Anna Capo, It should be A-double N-A C-
19 A-P-O and it, on the petition it appears as A-N-
20 A. Again, we checked the voter registration
21 record. Ms. -- there's only one A. Capo
22 registered at the address stated on the petition.
23 She is an enrolled member of the Conservative
24 Party. Again, no intent to deceive in leaving out

1 March 24, 2020

2 one letter, a double letter, again, in past
3 practice, this is something that the
4 commissioners have deemed as an acceptable
5 printer's error letter, subject to cure.

6 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

7 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I agree that we
8 accept the printer's error letter.

9 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you. 3/24/20. Okay.
10 The next relates to one volume of four filed for
11 candidates for delegate to the judicial
12 convention and alternate delegates from the 50th
13 Assembly District. It only relates to Volume 215.
14 The other three volumes are correct. We have a
15 signed letter dated March 17th, from Paul Bader,
16 the owner and printer, owner and CEO of New York
17 Prints, LLC, relating to candidates for judicial
18 delegate. The, on this volume, the apartment
19 number for candidate Elizabeth Adams appears as
20 E, the letters E for Elliot, S for Steven, when
21 it should be E5, that the apartment number for
22 Wayne Lays [phonetic] and Alonda Ocean [phonetic]
23 appear as S, Steven, N, Nancy. It should be 5N.
24 And that the apartment number for alternate

1 March 24, 2020

2 delegate Marcos Maresi appears as 210 when it
3 should be 21D.

4 I also want to point out commissioners,
5 that while apartment numbers are preferred, they
6 are optional under our rules, but I think again,
7 in the printer's error letter, the addresses are
8 correct, the apartment numbers are incorrect, but
9 by accepting this printer's error letter being on
10 file, in the event anyone wishes to challenge
11 them, they'll have the correct address to
12 challenge. So we'd recommend again that the --

13 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree.

14 MR. RICHMAN: -- printer's error letter
15 be accepted.

16 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Yes, I vote.

17 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: And I also vote yes,
18 the printer's error letter should be accepted.

19 MR. RICHMAN: And the last one also
20 comes --

21 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: The last one, or
22 are there two?

23 MR. RICHMAN: Yeah. The last one I'm
24 going to present and then we'll pull all the

1 March 24, 2020
2 others, 3/24/20. Again, from NYPrints CEO and
3 owner Paul Bader, this is truly I think a minimus
4 error. On Bronx Volume 217, the candidate for the
5 Assembly, Chantel Jackson. In the description of
6 the public office, they left out the TH after the
7 Assembly District. They just wrote 79 AD,
8 everything else is -- it should have been written
9 as 79th AD. He writes that this is a printer's
10 error, I hope that it will not cause any problems
11 for the candidate. He omitted this in printing
12 the petitions, leaving out the TH. Again, I don't
13 think it would even be defective in any way, but
14 again based on the receipt of a letter and our
15 past practice, I think again they were trying to
16 be overly cautious. And we recommend that the
17 commissioners accept the letters.

18 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I agree. I vote
19 yes.

20 MR. SAVINO: Yeah, they probably would
21 have been fine even without them.

22 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: They would have
23 been fine without it.

24 MR. SAVINO: Yeah, better safe than

1 March 24, 2020

2 sorry.

3 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: But it's, that's
4 just English language.

5 PRESIDENT TAYLOR: I vote yes, I agree.

6 MR. RICHMAN: Thank you.

7 MR. SAVINO: Thank you.

8 MR. RICHMAN: Commissioners, we also
9 have for the first time, something which we've
10 active- but I don't think it's necessary yet.
11 That we have a printer's error letter relating to
12 the committee to fill vacancies. That they
13 misprinted the address of Andrea Catsimatidis and
14 the correct address should be 817 5th Avenue. It
15 appears there at 875. I'm recommending we defer
16 action until time that the committee to vacancies
17 comes in and if there's any question where to
18 send notice, we can act on this.

19 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right.

20 MR. RICHMAN: But again, I think out of
21 the abundance of caution, given what is happening
22 in the tight timeframes, this was filed on Friday
23 at 10:32 p.m.

24 MR. SAVINO: And that's not

1 March 24, 2020

2 traditionally something we would review.

3 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Right. We wouldn't
4 review these normally, but what happens is I
5 guess they noticed it and they're reporting it to
6 us before we even get the stuff.

7 MR. SAVINO: Exactly.

8 MR. RICHMAN: Yes.

9 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: I would just hold
10 off and wait until we get the petition.

11 MR. RICHMAN: No, no, you have the
12 petition.

13 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Oh, you have it?

14 MR. RICHMAN: The only question would be
15 is in the event the candidate declines it --

16 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Declines it.

17 MR. RICHMAN: -- and the committee of
18 the vacancies has to act and we have to send the
19 communication to the committee --

20 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: We have to send a
21 letter, right.

22 MR. RICHMAN: -- we now have the
23 corrected address, so I think we would just file
24 this --

1 March 24, 2020

2 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: File it.

3 MR. RICHMAN: -- because there's no
4 purpose in approving it because there's nothing
5 to correct, because we don't review the committee
6 to fill vacancies until such time --

7 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: That we need it.

8 MR. RICHMAN: -- that we need it. So
9 commissioners, that concludes the initial review.

10 COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Mm-hmm.

11 MR. RICHMAN: I want to publicly state
12 that we had several of our staff members,
13 including the two temporary attorneys and Eleanor
14 Guerrieri go sick on us at the beginning of the
15 week. Eleanor is awaiting the results of the
16 exam, but we've lost them. Rafael and the team
17 members who have been present with me, we
18 normally have a 30-member cover sheet review
19 team, but that's down to about six.

20 MR. SAVINO: They did a good job.

21 MR. RICHMAN: So we're running a little
22 bit slower than we did and we'll deal with it
23 Friday as well, commissioners. But we have no
24 further business to present to you, so Madam

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

March 24, 2020

President, a motion to adjourn would be in order.

PRESIDENT TAYLOR: So moved.

COMMISSIONER MICHEL: Second.

MR. RICHMAN: Thank you, commissioners.

MR. SAVINO: Thank you, commissioners.

(The meeting concluded.)

CERTIFICATE OF ACCURACY

I, Claudia Marques, certify that the foregoing transcript of the Board of Elections in The City of New York on March 24, 2020 was prepared using the required transcription equipment and is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Certified By



Date: January 18, 2021

GENEVAWORLDWIDE, INC

256 West 38th Street - 10th Floor

New York, NY 10018