

MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 19, 2019 AT 1:30 P.M.  
42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM  
NEW YORK, NY 10004

---

PRESENT: President John Wm. Zaccone  
Secretary Patricia Anne Taylor

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Miguelina Camilo, John Flateau, Michael Michel, Simon Shamoun, Tiffany Townsend, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director  
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director  
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager  
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel  
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel  
Valerie Vazquez, Communications and Public Affairs  
Steven Guglielmi, Director, Personnel  
Sherwin Suss, Agency Chief Contract Officer, Procurement  
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners  
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Eddie Cuesta, Dominicanos USA  
Bonnie Nelson, Brooklyn Voters Alliance  
Wendy Byrne, LWV NYC  
Erica Cohen, BVA  
Eve Grassfield, Mayor's Office  
Katharine Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board  
Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Party

---

President Zaccone called the meeting to order at 1:36 P.M.

President Zaccone moved to table the minutes from the October 15, 2019 and November 12, 2019 meetings due to an insufficient number of Commissioners present to vote. The motion was seconded, and unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan and Ms. Vazquez provided an update on Early Voting and the November 5, 2019 General Election. The information is as follows:

- Poll Worker Recruitment:
  - Poll worker recruitment ads were translated into the required languages citywide from the period of July 2019 through September 2019. There were a total of 14,950 ads;
  - A total of 14,596 people applied to become a poll worker compared to 10,081 from the previous election. After poll worker payroll is complete, Ms. Vazquez will report on the amount of poll workers who worked;
  - A Partnership, advertising experts in the Asian American community, recruited a total of 489 poll worker applications for Chinese and Korean translators. There were 415 Chinese and 74 Korean applications

submitted to the Board. The Board's goal was to fill 306 translator vacancies;

- Public Education Campaign:
  - On the Board's social media accounts, the Board was praised by both New Yorkers and elected officials for the new branded poll site signage, sandwich boards, pathway markers, "I Voted Early" stickers and bracelets, and quick voting in the poll sites citywide;
  - There were a total of 228,000 hits on the Board's newly designed website from October 10, 2019 to present;
  - There were a total of 361,767 hits on the Board's PollSiteLocator.com;
  - Half-page ads were printed in various newspapers citywide at a total of 18,911 impressions;
  - There were a total of 64 million impressions viewed on screen for Twitter, FaceBook, Instagram, and online newspaper pop-up digital ads. Ms. Vazquez will provide the number of clicks on the impressions at the next meeting;
  - There were a total of 13,449 impressions on the NYC Link kiosks citywide. NYC Link gave 255,000

bonus impressions running the Board's ads on their kiosks for a longer period of time;

- Ms. Vazquez will provide a detailed report on the subway, Staten Island Railway, bus, and ferry ads at the next meeting;
- Elected officials, community groups and good government groups shared the Board's public education kit as well to help spread information.

Ms. Vazquez reported that the Board's aggressive and consistent branding approach for public education was very effective this election cycle. There was a lot of positive energy from the poll workers and voters. The Commissioners commended Executive Management, Ms. Vazquez, the Chief Clerks and Deputy Chief Clerks, and staff for a job well done. Secretary Taylor inquired if the various marketing tools for Early Voting affected turnout for Election Day. Mr. Ryan reported that there was a general upward trend in voting. There were a half million more voters this election cycle from last year. Commissioner Araujo recommended for the Board to promote and brand the unique Voter Card with barcode as a "Fast Pass" for the next election cycle. It was noted that some poll workers were referring to the Board's Voter Card as an I.D. Card and that language confused some voters at the check-in table.

Ms. Vazquez reported that the Communications and Public Affairs Working Group will look into that recommendation and anticipates on redesigning the Board's Annual Information Mailer with Vanguard. The Working Group will have a debriefing meeting and will review all feedback from the Commissioners, staff, and public. Commissioner Flateau recommended for Executive Management to discuss the Affidavit Ballot Envelope with New York State Legislators. He noted that the New York State Board of Elections promulgates the Affidavit Ballot Envelope for the City Board and can be confusing to voters when filling it out. President Zaccone recommended for the Board to discuss a potential word limit concerning City Charter Revision Proposals with the City Council in the future. The font size was fine print on the ballot due to their lengthy proposals. Mr. Ryan noted that the Board's public education campaign encouraged voters to view or download their sample ballot before Election Day. The PDF on the Board's website allowed voters to enlarge their sample ballot.

President Zaccone noted that Commissioner Townsend and Commissioner Shamoun joined the meeting.

With a quorum present, Commissioner Michel moved to adopt the minutes from the October 15, 2019 meeting. Secretary Taylor seconded

the motion, with Commissioners Araujo and Flateau abstaining. The motion was adopted. Commissioner Flateau moved to adopt the minutes from the November 12, 2019 meeting. Commissioner Camilo seconded the motion, with President Zaccone and Commissioners Araujo and Michel abstaining. The motion was adopted.

Mr. Ryan reported the following update for Early Voting and the November 5, 2019 General Election:

- 1,247 Election Day poll sites;
- 61 Early Voting sites;
- 1,134 Scanners were deployed on Election Day;
- 480 Scanners were deployed for Early Voting;
- 4,714 Electronic Poll Books were deployed on Election Day;
- 470 Electronic Poll Books were deployed for Early Voting;
- There was one (1) Cradlepoint device per poll site. Some larger poll sites required two (2) Cradlepoint devices;
- 49 out of the 61 portable generators on stand-by were utilized for Early Voting due to electrical capacity issues. This issue will be looked into the future when designating poll sites for Early Voting;

- There was positive feedback from poll workers and voters with the new Electronic Poll Book and Ballot on Demand (BOD) System process citywide. There were some syncing issues at some sites which were resolved, but will be addressed by adding more labeling on the devices;
- A total of 564 poll sites required some type of temporary ADA accessibility remediation such as ramps, cones, and mats. The Board is vigilant to ensure that all poll sites meet accessibility standards;
- Election Night Reporting (ENR) hit its peak at 9:15 P.M. on Election Day. In accordance with the law, Early Voting results were not uploaded in the system until 8:00pm on Election Night so it does not sway voters' decision making.

Commissioner Flateau inquired if the Board has received a better response with the City concerning capital resources to install permanent ADA ramps and/or widening of doorways at their public buildings. Mr. Ryan reported that the City has a timetable, but it is a slow process. Mr. Ryan reported that the Board used its own Help America Vote Act (HAVA) funds to install a permanent concrete pathway at a NYC DOE public school right before the election cycle. The poll site's accessible

entrance was across a grass lawn from the sidewalk. The new pathway is ADA compliant and the entrance has no interaction with students.

President Zaccone noted that Mr. Moltner joined the meeting.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Election Commissioners' Association (ECA) of the State of New York Annual Winter Conference is being held from January 6, 2019 through January 9, 2020 in Albany, NY. Copies of the ECA Winter Conference packet were circulated to the Commissioners for review. Mr. Ryan requested approval from the Commissioners to grant Executive Management authorization to designate staff to attend the ECA Annual Winter Conference. Commissioner Umane moved to approve Mr. Ryan's request as presented. President Zaccone seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Suss provided a brief overview of the upcoming contracts which will be presented to the Commissioners' Finance Committee. Copies of the memorandum were circulated to the Commissioners for review.

Commissioner Araujo moved to convene an Executive Session for personnel and litigation matters. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed. President Zaccone reported that several items were discussed in Executive Session, but no actions were taken.

Mr. Ryan reported that to prepare for the 2020 election cycle, the Commissioners authorized an open public commentary period for all interested parties who wish to provide feedback on their Early Voting experience and/or to offer recommendations. A dedicated email address will be created and posted on the Board's website through December 17, 2019.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners is scheduled for Tuesday, November 26, 2019 at 1:30 P.M.

Commissioner Umane moved to adjourn the meeting. President Zaccone seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.