

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF CANVASSERS  
AND MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
HELD ON TUESDAY, JULY 16, 2019 AT 1:30 P.M.  
42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM  
NEW YORK, NY 10004

---

PRESENT:       President John Wm. Zaccone  
                  Secretary Patricia Anne Taylor

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Miguelina Camilo, John Flateau, Michael Michel, Simon Shamoun, Tiffany Townsend, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director  
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director  
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager  
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager  
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel  
Steven Guglielmi, Director, Personnel  
Sherwin Suss, Agency Chief Contract Officer, Procurement  
Stephen Thompson, Manager, Poll Site Device/Tablet Unit  
Matthew Graves, Project Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit  
Rachel Torres, Administrative Assistant, Candidate Records Unit  
Raymond Riley, Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office  
Daniel Ortiz, Deputy Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office  
Anthony Andriulli, Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office  
Don Bosco, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office  
Patricia Kelly, Senior Administrative Assistant, Queens Office  
Kenneth Coughlin, Administrative Associate, Queens Office  
Greg Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office  
Cynthia Doty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office  
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST:       Kate Doran, LWV  
                  Hilda Soloman  
                  Johnny Hogan  
                  Katharine Loving, NYC CFB

Wendy Byrne, LWV NYC  
Laura Wood, Mayor's Office  
Jan Combopiano, Brooklyn Voters Alliance

---

President Zaccone called the meeting to order at 1:45 P.M.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, President Zaccone called the Meeting of the Board of Canvassers to certify the results of the June 25, 2019 Primary Elections for Public Office and Party Positions.

To serve as the other Republican Member of the Canvassing Board, President Zaccone designated the Republican Commissioner for their respective counties and Commissioner Shamoun to serve with him for Richmond County. Secretary Taylor moved to designate the Democratic Commissioner for their respective counties and Commissioner Camilo to serve with her for Richmond County.

President Zaccone reported that pursuant to Chapter 5 of the Laws of 2019 enacted in January of this year, the consolidated Primary Elections in the State of New York was set for the fourth Tuesday in June. The June 25, 2019 Primary Elections were the first conducted under this

recent statutory enactment. There were no Primary Election contests in Bronx County.

President Zaccone noted that Commissioner Townsend joined the meeting.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Brooklyn and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in Kings County on June 25, 2019. Mr. Riley and Mr. Ortiz presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Riley and Mr. Ortiz confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and this Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There were no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Flateau moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in Kings County on June 25, 2019. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Queens and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in Queens County on June 25, 2019, with the exception of the Democratic Primary contest for District Attorney of Queens County. The Board, pursuant to the adopted Policies and Procedures, is currently conducting a full manual canvass for that contest. Accordingly, there is no Statement and Return of Canvass for that contest to be considered. Ms. Kelly, on behalf of Ms. Berinato, and Mr. Coughlin, on behalf of Mr. Haggerty, presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Kelly and Mr. Coughlin confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and this Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There was a discrepancy which did not affect the outcome of the results. The Discrepancy Report is attached to the Statement and Return of Canvass. Based on that report, Commissioner Araujo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in Queens County on June 25, 2019.

Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Staten Island and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in Richmond County on June 25, 2019. Mr. Bosco and Mr. Andriulli presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Bosco and Mr. Andriulli confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and this Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There were no discrepancies. Based on that report, Secretary Taylor moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in Richmond County on June 25, 2019. President Zaccone seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Zaccone noted that Commissioner Umame joined the meeting.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of New York County and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in New York County on June 25, 2019. Mr. Lehman and Ms. Doty presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Lehman and Ms. Doty confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and this Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There were discrepancies which did not affect the outcome of the results. The Discrepancy Report is attached to the Statement and Return of Canvass. Based on that report, Commissioner Umane moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the Primary Elections conducted in New York County on June 25, 2019. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Umane reported that two (2) ballots were subsequently found in the Manhattan Voting Machine Facility that were not counted and requested to amend the results of those elections. These

ballots do not affect the outcome of the races. Mr. Lehman provided an overview of two (2) memorandums to the Commissioners. He reported that one (1) ballot for the November 7, 2017 General Election was deemed valid and canvassed in the 67 ED/76 AD, and one (1) ballot was deemed valid and canvassed in the 88 ED/66 AD in New York County. Commissioner Umane moved to amend these two (2) Statements and Return of Canvass to reflect the missing votes based on the two (2) memorandums. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Secretary Taylor moved to electronically affix the appropriate Commissioners' signatures as previously designated on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Secretary Taylor moved to adjourn the meeting of the Board of Canvassers and to convene the weekly stated meeting of the Commissioners of Elections in the City of New York. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Townsend moved to adopt the minutes of the July 9, 2019 meeting. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, with Commissioner Araujo abstaining. The motion was adopted.

President Zaccone requested to add an item to the agenda. He recommended establishing a Board policy to limit two (2) minutes for each member of the public who is recognized to speak at a Stated Meeting. Public notice would be posted on the Board's website, in the public hearing room, and on the Request to Speak form. President Zaccone moved to adopt the proposed Board policy as presented, effective next meeting. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Zaccone noted that Ms. Sandow joined the meeting.

Mr. Ryan reported on the Board's Early Voting equipment needs. He recalled that this item was discussed at the previous meeting and additional information has been compiled for the Commissioners' review and consideration. Mr. Thompson and Mr. Suss provided a summary overview of the Early Voting equipment needs. The information is as follows:

- Cradlepoint Device Specifications

- Information on Cradlepoint devices was previously emailed to the Commissioners for review. Copies of the specifications were distributed;
- Cradlepoint devices are commercial grade Wi-Fi's and provider agnostic. They can operate simultaneously with Verizon and AT&T providers so there would never be a loss of bandwidth for Early Voting and Election Day;
- Cradlepoints can be used with the City's Verizon and AT&T contracts and will be the same costs as the current Mi-Fi's;
- Board staff would have an office dashboard with the ability to monitor each Cradle Point device on Election Day;
- Approximately 1,400 units would be ordered for Election Day poll sites, Early Voting poll sites, training sites, and spares;
- One (1) Cradlepoint device per poll site. Maybe two (2) devices for sites that have two (2) poll rooms;
- Each Cradlepoint has a 1 Gigabit speed for the server's capacity to provide transactional data for the E-Poll Books for Early Voting and Election Day;

- Other jurisdictions have successfully used Cradlepoints;
- 5G service can be used in the future, if needed;
- Cradlepoints have an eight (8) hour battery life. There are limitations with space and weight in the carrying case, therefore, auxiliary power supplies will be looked into further. Cradlepoints can plug into the Ballot Marking Device (BMD) outlets;
- Cradlepoints will be synced to the E-Poll Books by staff before they are deployed on Election Day;
- The Chief Clerks and Deputy Chief Clerks will send Mr. Thompson a list of poll sites that has had signal issues with Wi-Fi connectivity in the past;
- At the request of President Zaccone, Mr. Thompson will look into Repeater Wi-Fi boosters for those problem sites;
- Cradlepoints are expenditures off the master service agreement with NYC DOITT and the price quote will be provided at the next meeting.
- Charging Cart Specifications
  - Copies of the specifications were distributed to the Commissioners for review;

- Board staff presented a sample Bretford USB Charging Cart (Model HGFN2) for the Commissioners to examine;
- Each cart holds twenty (20) E-Poll Book iPads on one (1) shelf for charging, storage and transportation for Early Voting and training sites. At the request of the Commissioners, Mr. Thompson will look into the Charging Carts that hold forty (40) E-Poll Book iPads;
- Bretford does not sell their products directly. Mr. Suss contacted several Minority and Woman-Owned business Enterprises (MWBE) and Shi International Corp. responded with a pricing proposal of \$1,405.97 per unit. Mr. Suss requested approval to micro purchase 104 units from Shi International Corp at a total sum of \$146,220.88. Commissioner Araujo moved to approve the \$150,000 micro purchase of the Charging Carts as presented. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.
- iPad Specifications
  - Copies of the specifications were distributed to the Commissioners for review;

- Mr. Thompson recommended ordering the 32GB iPad. The entire voter file and signature image files can be uploaded on the tablet as well as the signature image files. The signature files take up the most space on the iPad;
- The Commissioners recommended ordering the 128GB iPad as a safety net should the Board implement Early Voting boroughwide in the future. 128GB would accommodate all voter signatures file photos citywide. The price difference is \$100 per unit at a total of \$1 million, a 5% increase in overall costs;
- Mr. Thompson will look into the updating and reloading of election data processing of each iPad further;
- The Hardware with 128GB will be \$9,850,000 for 10,000 units. Cost per iPad is \$405.00, Transport Case is \$125.00, Stand is \$40.00, two (2) Styluses are \$2.50, and Battery Powered Printer is \$400.00, and \$10.00 Shipping Fee. The Software is \$4,000,000 with a training component of \$48,000. Twelve (12) elections are built into the contract with a component for provided staffing based upon the recommendation of KnowInk. Four (4)

year contract with \$1,000,000 per year, after the first year, for maintenance and licensing. Maintenance includes upgrading of the software. A total contract of \$19,130,000;

- There is \$21 million available in the Board's budget for Electronic Poll (E-Poll) Books and a portion for the BOD system for Early Voting. The State will reimburse a total of \$5 million for E-Poll Books which will go back into the City funds;
- President Zaccone moved to direct staff to purchase the 128GB storage capacity iPad moving forward as presented. Secretary Taylor seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. President Zaccone noted that Commissioner Araujo had to leave the meeting and did not vote on this matter;
- Mr. Ryan demonstrated the E-Poll Book scanner feature using the Board's voter card. The E-Poll Book is currently set-up with a function to scan the voter's unique barcode which automatically identifies the voter in the system when they check-in at the poll site.

- Ballot on Demand (BOD) Printer Specifications
  - Copies of the specifications were distributed to the Commissioners for review;
  - It is a black and white printer. There was a change in the law which allows for black and white ballots;
  - There is a Poll Print Ballot Station which is a lockable metal cart that contains the printer and is used for storage, security and transportation. It also contains a 32GB tablet which stores the PDF ballot styles. KnowInk recommended 32GB for the Board's needs;
  - The costs follow:
    - iPad – \$310 each;
    - Printer – \$600 each;
    - Adapter cable package – \$150 each;
    - Cabin with back-up battery – \$2,000;
    - Software License – Mr. Suss will get back with the pricing on this item;
    - Total cost of equipment – \$5,643,500 for 1,500 units. 1,500 units include ten (10) per poll site, training, and spares. Mr. Ryan reported that this amount is sufficient to operate 100 Early Voting

sites and requested approval to move forward with the purchasing;

- Commissioner Umame moved for staff to acquire the recommended amount of BOD Printers, excluding the Software License amount, as presented. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. Mr. Suss will provide the first year Software Licensing amount at the next meeting. Mr. Suss will ask KnowInk if the 32BG tablets will be sufficient if the Board moves forward with boroughwide ballots.
- Scanners
  - At the request of Mr. Ryan, this item was tabled for one (1) week.
- Privacy Booths
  - At the request of Mr. Ryan, this item was tabled for one (1) week.

Secretary Taylor thanked the staff for providing materials to the Commissioners in advance of the meeting.

Commissioner Umane moved to convene an Executive Session for personnel. Commissioner Camilo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed. President Zaccone reported that three (3) actions were taken on personnel matters which will be reported at a later date.

President Zaccone recognized the following speaker for public comment:

1. Jan Combopiano.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, July 23, 2019 at 1:30 P.M.

Commissioner Flateau moved to adjourn the meeting. Secretary Taylor seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.