

MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON TUESDAY, JANUARY 23, 2018 AT 1:30 P.M.
42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM
NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Rosanna Vargas
 Secretary John Wm. Zaccone

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Maria R. Guastella, Michael Michel, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Joshua Williams, Contract Attorney, Office of the General Counsel
Steven Guglielmi, Director, Personnel
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications and Public Affairs
Sherwin Suss, Agency Chief Contract Officer, Procurement
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Katharine Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board
 Kate Doran, LWWNYC

President Vargas called the meeting to order at 1:37 P.M.

Secretary Zaccone reported that he submitted an amendment to the January 16, 2018 Minutes, highlighted on page 7, to note that Commissioner Shamoun did not participate in Executive Session.

Secretary Zaccone moved to adopt the minutes for the January 16, 2018 meeting as amended. The motion was seconded, with Commissioners Guastella and Michel abstaining. The motion was adopted.

President Vargas added an Executive Session for personnel matters for Queens, Manhattan, Brooklyn, and the Bronx.

Mr. Denkberg joined the meeting.

President Vargas recommended designating the Commissioners Committee Members for 2018. The designations are as follows:

- **Budget & Finance** – Commissioners Flateau, Schulkin, Siano, Umane, Vargas, and Zaccone
- **Communications, Voter Registration and Outreach** – Commissioners Siano and Flateau
- **Management Information Systems and Services** – Commissioners Schulkin and Shamoun
- **Legislative Affairs** – Commissioners Flateau, Schulkin, Shamoun, and Zaccone
- **Personnel** – Commissioners Guastella, Shamoun, Siano, Flateau, Vargas, and Zaccone

- **Ballot Layout** – Commissioners Araujo, Guastella, Michel, and Zaccone

President Vargas noted that Mr. Ryan joined the meeting.

Mr. Ryan requested to add a report to the agenda concerning the After Hours Car Service Contracts. Secretary Zaccone moved to amend the agenda to include the consideration of After Hours Car Service Contracts. Secretary Vargas seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Suss presented the After Hours Car Service Contracts. The current contracts have expired for the General Office, Brooklyn Office and Manhattan Office. These car service contracts are for Board staff members who work overtime. Mr. Suss reported that this year the Procurement Department aimed to implement car service per location as opposed to county, but there were not enough bids. After meeting with the Commissioners Finance Committee, the following contracts have been recommended to be awarded:

- **General Office, 32 - 42 Broadway**
 - First Class Car Service – Four (4) year contract, not to exceed \$2,497,920;
- **Brooklyn Office, 345 Adams Street**
 - Skyline – Four (4) year contract, not to exceed \$838,080;
- **Brooklyn Voting Machine Facility, 5112 2nd Avenue**
 - Corporate Transportation Group – Four (4) year contract, not to exceed \$584,429;
- **Manhattan Office, 200 Varick Street**
 - Executive Charge – Four (4) year contract, not to exceed \$432,624;
- **Manhattan Voting Machine Facility, 450 W. 33rd Street**
 - Executive Charge – Four (4) year contract, not to exceed \$410,032.

Commissioner Shamoun inquired if these contracts are adopted, if it would preclude the Board from entering into any other contracts if better options are found in the future. Mr. Suss reported that it would not preclude any other companies. Commissioner Shamoun recommended for the Procurement Department to continue exploring technology/internet based car services such as Uber, for an example, which have more cars,

flexibility, and are less expensive. He noted that sometimes employees have to wait over an hour for car service to pick them up and then the Board has to pay them for that hour. Mr. Suss reported that other car services can be utilized as long as the company is registered in the City's Passport system and complies with the City's Procurement Policy Board Rules. It was reported that the Board could invite companies to join the City's system. Mr. Suss noted that the City uses price certainty for budgetary purposes and there is no price certainty with technology based car companies like Uber. Commissioner Schulkin moved to approve the recommended After Hours Car Service Contracts for the General Office, Brooklyn Office and Manhattan Office as presented, and to direct the Procurement Department to explore technology/internet based car service options, like Uber, within 45 days. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, with Commissioner Umane recusing himself. The motion was adopted. Commissioner Umane noted that he recused himself because he has done business with several of these companies.

Secretary Zaccone moved to convene an Executive Session for personnel matters. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and Mr. Ryan reported the following actions that were taken in Executive Session:

- I. The Commissioners granted 210 hours Discretionary Advance of Time to Robert Taylor, a Clerk in the Queens Office, retroactive to December 12, 2017. Mr. Taylor's agency start date is September 24, 2000;
- II. The Commissioners granted 105 hours Advance of Time to Wanda Davis, a Clerk in the Manhattan Office, effective January 23, 2018. Mr. Davis' agency start date is August 9, 2009;
- III. The Commissioners granted 210 hours Advance of Time to Nicole Smith, a Clerk in the Bronx Office, retroactive to January 17, 2018. Ms. Smith's agency start date is July 15, 2010;
- IV. Steven Porpora, a Computer Operator in the General Office, retired on January 12, 2018. The Commissioners appointed James Friscia, a Financial Clerk in the General Office, to fill Mr. Porpora's vacancy, retroactive to January 14, 2018;
- V. The Commissioners unanimously transferred the title of Raquel Torres, a Voting Machine Technician in the General Office, to

Administrative Assistant, replacing Rahme Murad. Ms. Torres will receive the incumbent salary and any merit raises will remain with her. Commissioner Araujo recused himself from this matter. He did not participate in any discussions or deliberations.

Commissioner Umane moved to adjourn the meeting. Secretary Vargas seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, January 30, 2018 at 1:30 P.M.