

MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 15, 2016  
AT 1:30 P.M.  
42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM  
NEW YORK, NY 10004

---

PRESENT: President Maria R. Guastella  
Secretary Frederic M. Umane

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Lisa Grey, Michael Michel,  
Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Rosanna Vargas

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director  
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director  
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager  
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager  
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel  
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel  
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs  
Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel  
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners  
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Harald Wacker  
Jamie Hacker, Dechert LLP  
Amanda Melillo, NYC CFB  
Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee  
Kate Doran, LWVNYC  
Katharine Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board

---

President Guastella called the meeting to order at 1:44 P.M.

Mr. Ryan requested to add an item to the agenda. He requested for the Commissioners' approval to close the Board's Offices the day after Thanksgiving on Friday, November 25, 2016 in lieu of staff working General Election Day. Secretary Umame moved to close the Board's Offices on Friday, November 25, 2016 in lieu of staff working General Election Day. President Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Election Commissioners Association (ECA) of the State of New York has scheduled their Winter Conference from January 9, 2016 through January 12, 2016 in Albany, NY and requested for Commissioners' approval for Board staff to attend. President Guastella moved for Executive Management to approve appropriate staff members to attend the NYS ECA Winter Conference from January 9, 2016 through January 12, 2016. Secretary Umame seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. It was noted that Executive Management may be participating at the Conference with a presentation on the Board's Election Night Reporting process.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Board has received preliminary notification of a New York Assembly Hearing scheduled on November 29, 2016. The

Election Law Committee would like to discuss cyber security and related issues. Formal notification will be circulated to the Commissioners once it is received.

President Guastella recognized Alan Flacks, a member of the public, who inquired about poll worker pay raises.

President Guastella noted that Commissioners Vargas and Grey joined the meeting.

President Guastella recognized Alan Flacks, a member of the public, who spoke about good government groups' poll worker recruitment efforts.

Mr. Ryan provided a preliminary report on the November 8, 2016 General Election which follows:

- A total of 39,000 poll workers were trained and assigned to work on Election Day citywide. In addition, there were poll worker stand-by pools;
- A total of 1,205 poll sites were opened citywide;
- Manhattan had 2 sites that were opened late due to NYPD issues;
- The Bronx had 1 site that was opened late due to a key issue;

- Brooklyn had 2 sites that were opened late due to NYPD issues;
- A total of 3,595 scanners were deployed citywide;
- Ballot bins were filling up quickly in Manhattan and the Bronx. Instructions were given to the NYPD Officers and poll workers, and a total of 46 ballot bins were swapped out. Each ballot bin can hold up to 1,100 ballots. The Board made a determination to swap out the bins at 1,000 ballots which was successful;
- There were 1,878 scanner issues citywide. A total of 31 scanners were replaced due to various issues. It was noted that 2.5 million voters scanned their ballot;
- Ballot jams have significantly decreased. The average repair time was less than 1 hour;
- A total of 3,000 tablets were deployed citywide to poll sites, Police Precincts, AD Monitors, and Voting Machine Technicians;
- There was a 92% successful wireless connection with the tablets. It was reported that poll sites located in basements had connectivity issues while using the backup Wi-Fi “Jet Packs.” This issue will be looked into further;
- A total of 28 tablets were replaced in Manhattan. All other boroughs each had less than 9 tablet replacements;

- There was a total of 11,000 separate interactions made on the tablets;
- There was a total of 2,700 tablet “check-ins” by poll workers. It was noted that poll worker tablet “check-ins” will improve and increase over time;
- The tablets and Poll Site Locator greatly assisted and sped up voter lines in the poll sites;
- Many voters brought their “Voter Information Notice” to the poll site which helped speed up lines to the ED/AD tables;
- 1-way messaging on the tablets was utilized informing the poll workers about a Federal Court Order and voting procedures. 2-way messaging will be utilized on the tablets in the future;
- A total of 339 sites required ADA temporary remediation such as ramps, leveling systems and mats. There were 13 separate vendors as well as on-site staff who installed the ADA temporary equipment. It was noted that the final surveys of every poll site concerning accessibility are not finished yet;
- Election Night Reporting of the unofficial results was successful. The uploading was slower in the beginning of the night due to ballot images that were uploaded on the PMD’s, and some voters still voting until 10:00 P.M. at several sites which had long lines.

Peak time for uploading was at 9:20 P.M. At 10:00 P.M., 80.36% of results were uploaded. At 11:00 P.M., 92% of the results were uploaded. Mr. Ryan noted that New York City was a national leader in reporting unofficial results on Election Night;

- The unofficial voter turnout citywide was 2,519,390 on the machines only. There are a total of 4,477,091 active voters in New York City. There was 56.3% voter turnout which will increase as affidavit, absentee, military, and federal ballots are counted.
- Mr. Ryan reported that General Election information will be reported again after it is has been further reviewed and finalized by staff.

President Guastella recognized Alan Flacks, a member of the public, who inquired if ES&S provides service on Election Day and spoke about the training of Coordinators and poll workers.

Commissioner Vargas moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of personnel and litigation. The motion was seconded, and unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and Mr. Ryan reported the following action taken in Executive Session:

- I. The Commissioners granted an advance of 28 hours to Shontia Vaughn, an Administrative Associate in the General Office. Ms. Vaughn has been an employee since January 26, 1992.

Commissioner Schulkin moved to adjourn the meeting. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, November 22, 2016 at 1:30 P.M.