

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF CANVASSERS AND
MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 2015
AT 1:30 P.M.
42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM
NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Michael Michel
 Secretary Bianka Perez

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Ronald Castorina, John Flateau, Maria R. Guastella, Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs
Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel
Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office
Lisa Sattie, Administrative Associate, Staten Island Office
Diane Rudiano, Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office
Daniel Ortiz, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office
Marricka Scott-McFadden, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office
Frank Tosi, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office
Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office
Robert Pataky, Administrative Associate, Queens Office
Gregory Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office
William Anthony Allen, Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Emily Forgione, Campaign Finance Board
 Kate Doran, LWV NYC
 Anna-Maria Thomas
 Charles Davis, NYC Council

John D. Smith
Cathy Gray
Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee

President Michel called the meeting to order at 1:37 P.M.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, President Michel convened the Meeting of the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York for the purposes of certifying the canvass of votes cast on November 3, 2015 in the General and Special Elections conducted within the City of New York.

To serve as the other Republican Member of the Canvassing Board, President Michel designated the Republican Commissioner for the respective counties and Commissioner Umane to serve with him for Queens County.

To serve as the other Democratic Member of the Canvassing Board, Secretary Perez designated the Democratic Commissioner for the respective counties and Commissioner Guastella to serve with her for Bronx County.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Queens and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 3, 2015 General and Special Elections conducted in Queens County. Mr. Haggerty and Mr. Pataky, on behalf of Ms. Conacchio, presented the statements to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Haggerty and Mr. Pataky confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct. There are no discrepancies and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Araujo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the November 3, 2015 General and Special Elections conducted in Queens County. Commissioner Umame seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Staten Island and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 3, 2015 General and Special Elections conducted in Richmond County. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie, on behalf of Ms. DelGiorno, presented the statements to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie confirmed that the results presented are

accurate and correct. There are no discrepancies and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Guastella moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the November 3, 2015 General and Special Elections conducted in Richmond County. Commissioner Castorina seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Deputy Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk of the Bronx and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 3, 2015 General Election conducted in Bronx County. Ms. Scott-McFadden and Mr. Tosi presented the statements to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Scott-McFadden and Mr. Tosi confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct. There are no discrepancies and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Guastella moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the November 3, 2015 General Election conducted in Bronx County.

Commissioner Umame seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk of Brooklyn and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 3, 2015 General Election conducted in Kings County. Ms. Rudiano and Mr. Ortiz presented the statements to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Rudiano and Mr. Ortiz confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct. There are no discrepancies and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Flateau moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the November 3, 2015 General Election conducted in Kings County. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Manhattan and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 3, 2015 General Election conducted in New York County. Mr. Lehman and Mr. Allen presented the statements to the Canvassing

Board for review and approval. Mr. Lehman and Mr. Allen confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct. There are no discrepancies and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Umame moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the November 3, 2015 General Election conducted in New York County. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Commissioners thanked all Borough Office staff members for their hard work during the election cycle.

Commissioner Guastella moved to authorize the use of the Commissioners' signature stamps as appropriate on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Commissioner Umame seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adjourn the Meeting of the Board of Canvassers and to convene the regular stated meeting of the

Commissioners of Elections in the City of New York. President Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Secretary Perez requested to discuss a Bronx personnel matter in Executive Session.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the minutes for the November 17, 2015 meeting. The motion was seconded, with Commissioners Guastella and Castorina abstaining. The motion was adopted.

Mr. Ryan reported on the Board's Testimony before the New York State Assembly Committee on Election Law held on November 18, 2015. In attendance were Mr. Ryan, Mr. Richman and Mr. Savino. A copy of the Board's Testimony is attached to the agenda. Mr. Ryan reported that the primary topic concerned Early Voting. Per the Commissioners' direction, the Board took no official position on the Legislative Agenda's items, however, will stand ready to aid in the implementation of the items discussed if legislation is passed. During the Q&A session, there were many technical implementation questions for the City Board. Mr. Ryan advised the Committee members that it was impossible to give the exact

issues concerning implementation until there was a full-fledged plan for Early Voting. He urged the Committee that if legislation is passed, that a sufficient period is built into the implementation process for the Board to review the legislation to effectively plan for it. Mr. Ryan noted that he highlighted the Board's Proposal to close public schools for both Primary and General Elections so those poll sites will be fully accessible. The NYS Assembly Committee on Election Law will be scheduling a local meeting concerning Election Day Operations on December 10, 2015 at 10:30 A.M. Mr. Ryan anticipates a formal invitation to testify and will notify the Commissioners once he receives formal notification. In the interim, staff will prepare a draft Testimony. Commissioner Umame suggested addressing the Board's Proposals that pertain to Election Day Operations in the draft.

President Michel requested to acquire more trucking companies to transport the voting equipment. He recalled that Queens is often short on trucks which cause delivery delays to the poll sites. President Michel requested for a detailed report on the trucking contracts including any damages.

President Michel moved to convene Executive Session for purposes of personnel. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the public meeting resumed and Mr. Ryan reported the following action taken in Executive Session:

- I. The Commissioners granted an advance of 140 hours to Nicole Smith, a Clerk in the Bronx Office, to be paid back with her accruals upon her return, and to be utilized as needed, which is subject to Personnel's review of medical documentation.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, December 8, 2015 at 1:30 P.M.