

HEARINGS RELATING TO DESIGNATING PETITIONS  
AND RELATED MATTERS FOR THE SEPTEMBER 10, 2013  
PRIMARY ELECTION AND THE MEETING OF THE  
COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
HELD ON TUESDAY, JULY 30, 2013  
AT 10:00 A.M.  
42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM  
NEW YORK, NY 10004

---

PRESENT:           President Frederic M. Umane  
                      Secretary Gregory C. Soumas

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Naomi Barrera, Julie Dent, Maria Guastella,  
Michael Michel, Michael Rendino, Simon Shamoun, J.P. Sipp

Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director  
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager  
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel  
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel  
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs  
John Ward, Finance Officer  
Dorothy Delayo, Director, Personnel  
Giacomo Kmet, Contract Attorney, OGC  
Anibal Luque, Contract Attorney, OGC  
Alan Quigley, Law Student Intern, OGC  
Matthew Bobrow, Law Student Intern, OGC  
John Naudus, Manager, Electronic Voting Systems  
Troy Johnson, Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit  
Rayvon Weaver, Administrative Assistant, Candidate Records Unit  
Ryan Deahn, Administrative Assistant, Candidate Records Unit  
Thomas Sattie, Associate Staff Analyst, Ballot Management  
Anthony Ribustello, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office  
Marricka Scott-McFadden, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office  
Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office  
Lisa Sattie, Administrative Associate, Staten Island Office  
Gisela Mengler, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office

Robert Pataky, Administrative Associate, Queens Office  
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners  
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Keith Corbett, for Raquel Batista  
K. Loving, CFB  
S. O'Leary  
R. Batista  
R. Vargas  
D. Simonett, for Cynthia Thompkins  
Anna Maria Thomas  
Manuel Ortega, for Fall  
Sheila McGinn, for Fall  
Ezra B. Glaser, for Stanton  
Joseph Hayon  
Leonard N. Kramer  
Stanley Shlein  
L. McReid  
Brian K.  
Priscilla Marco  
Walter Iwachiw  
Thomas Hillgardener, for Iwachiw  
Chris Oldenberg, CFB  
Hillary Weisman, CFB  
Ibrahim Ahmed, for Naaimat Muhammed  
Jessica Vigueras  
Daniel Simonette, for Jessica G.  
Carolyn Margolies  
Sam Burns  
Robert Press, Bronx News  
Paul Iuly  
Naaimat Muhammed  
Alberto Torres, for Carlos Sterra  
Kevin Elkins  
Lucy Locorotondo  
A. Neem  
Cynthia Thompkins  
Vera Osborn  
Carlo Arluto  
John D. Smith

Carlton Berkley  
Walter Newsome  
M. Welin  
A.B. Britton  
William Moore  
Mark Escoffery-Bey  
Zach Escoffery  
Andrew Lisko  
Chirma Newsome  
Garth Marchant  
Cathy Gray  
Mitchell G.  
John Whitehead  
J.K.L.  
Mvnir Avery  
G. Batista  
Tom Worbleski, SI Advance  
Robert Zahn  
Stanford Edie  
Clarke Ed  
David Martin  
John Mancuso  
Victor Gutierrez  
Matthew Bey  
Monica Bartley, CIDNY  
Nicole Margen  
Kate Doran, LWV  
Sam Sloan  
Rob Evans  
Eugene Evans  
N. V. Grimaldi, for Lee  
Yun, for Lee  
Seulbin, for Lee  
Arthur Griffin, for Thompson  
He Gin Lee  
Oliver Tan  
C. Gross, NY1  
M. Schultz, NY1  
Chester Soria, Gotham Gazette  
Michael Benjamin

Kevin Tang, for Gale Brewer  
Ellen E. Kang  
Bright Limon  
Michael A.  
A. Eptoff  
Lendell Sims  
Sophie Mancall-Bitel, CFB  
Bart Haggerty  
Jihoon Chang, Citizens Union  
Melisa Tekin, Citizens Union  
Jamie Moon, Citizens Union  
Eric Dotosh, Citizens Union  
Nicholas Bowe, Citizens Union  
Luna Liu  
Katherine A. James  
Brian Connor  
Kate Liggert  
Steiner  
James McClelland, for Koo  
Vanel  
Frank Samaroo, for McGowan  
Richie Lipkwoiz  
James Lloyd  
Michael Reid  
Hersh Parakah  
Frank Bolz  
Skurny  
Maragret Ognibene  
T. Ognibene  
Pierre Akantara  
Natalie Dubovici  
Isaac Baskin  
Robert Hornak  
Elizabeth Brown  
Everly Brown  
Eric Mincold  
Sunny Hahn  
Vincent Amato  
Stella Chan  
Raymond Dugue

Breina Puyne  
A.J. Urlich, for Anthony Weiner  
Bill Johnert  
Richard Luthmann  
Jessica Kasper  
Kenny Nunez

---

President Umane called the meeting to order at 10:16 A.M.

President Umane welcomed Michael Rendino, the newly appointed Republican Commissioner for Bronx County.

President Umane announced that the Commissioners would conduct the Hearings on Designating Petitions and related matters for the September 10, 2013 Primary Election, and stated the procedures to be followed during the Hearings. President Umane called upon Mr. Richman to call the calendar for the Hearings.

Mr. Richman reported that in accordance with the Commissioners' direction, notice was given to all interested and necessary parties concerning the Public Hearings to consider the Board's staff preliminary findings of Prima Facie Defects, Candidate Enrollment Issues, as well as Specifications of Objections, and other concerns relating to the

September 10, 2013 Primary Election.

Mr. Richman called for the Hearings on Bronx County matters.

Mr. Richman presented the Legal Prima Facie Report for Bronx County. There were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. Commissioner Barrera moved to adopt the Legal Prima Facie Report for Bronx County. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Richman presented the Bronx County Counsel's Report on Specification of Objections BX-54. There were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Counsel's Report on file at the Board. Commissioner Barrera moved to adopt the Counsel's Report. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Richman presented the Bronx County Counsel's Report on Specification of Objections BX-14 and BX-45. There were appearances by

a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Counsel's Report on file at the Board. After discussion, the Commissioners unanimously agreed to place this matter on second call today to research further.

Mr. Johnson presented the CRU Prima Facie Report for Bronx County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. Commissioner Barrera moved to adopt the CRU Prima Facie Report. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

Mr. Sattie presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for Bronx County. There were no appearances. Commissioner Barrera moved to adopt the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Savino called the Specifications of Objections for Bronx County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Reports on file at the Board.

The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon. Specification No. BX-47 was placed on second call for August 13, 2013 at 1:30pm.

Mr. Richman called for the Hearings on Richmond County matters.

Mr. Johnson presented the CRU Prima Facie Report for Richmond County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. Commissioner Sipp moved to adopt the CRU Prima Facie Report. Commissioner Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Johnson presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for Richmond County. There were no appearances. Commissioner Guastella moved to adopt the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report. Commissioner Sipp seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Richman called the Specifications of Objections for Richmond County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate



and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Reports on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

The Commissioners recessed the Hearings for thirty (30) minutes.

After recess, President Umane convened the regular stated meeting of the Commissioners.

Commissioner Michel moved to appoint Michael Ryan as the Board's Executive Director, effective immediately. Commissioner Sipp seconded the motion. In a roll call vote, there were five (5) in favor (Michel, Rendino, Shamoun, Sipp, Umane), two (2) opposing (Araujo, Barrera), and three (3) abstaining (Dent, Guastella, Soumas). The motion was not adopted.

Mr. Sattie presented the amount of ballots to order for the September 10, 2013 Primary Election. Copies of Mr. Sattie's report were distributed to the Commissioners. Commissioner Dent moved to adopt Mr. Sattie's report which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Naudus presented the draft Mechanical Lever Voting Machine Re-canvass Procedure. Copies of the draft procedure were distributed to the Commissioners. Commissioner Sipp moved to table this item for one (1) week. Commissioner Dent seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Barrera requested to add an Executive Session for purposes of personnel.

Mr. Ward presented the Vacancy Report dated July 30, 2013. A copy of the report is in the agenda.

The Commissioners unanimously agreed to convene the Executive Session after the Hearings are adjourned.

President Umane reconvened the Hearings on Designating Petitions and related matters for the September 10, 2013 Primary Election, and stated the procedures to be followed during the Hearings. President Umane called upon Mr. Richman to call the calendar for the Hearings.

Mr. Richman called for the Hearings on Citywide Office matters.

Mr. Johnson presented the Citywide CRU Prima Facie Report. There was an appearance by the candidate's representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. President Umane moved to adopt the Citywide CRU Prima Facie Report. Commissioner Barrera seconded the motion, with Commissioner Araujo abstaining. The motion was adopted. Commissioner Araujo noted that he abstained because he is the Court Examiner for a guardianship matter concerning the candidate's family member.

Mr. Richman called the Specifications of Objections for Citywide Offices. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Reports on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

President Umane announced the second call matter concerning the Bronx County Counsel's Report on Specification of Objections BX-14 and BX-45. The Commissioners researched this matter further during recess.

Commissioner Barrera moved to adopt the Counsel's Report. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Richman called for the Hearings on Queens County matters.

Mr. Johnson presented the CRU Prima Facie Report for Queens County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the CRU Prima Facie Report, excluding candidate Eric A. Ulrich from the report. Secretary Soumas seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Johnson presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for Queens County. There were no appearances. Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Denkberg called the Specifications of Objections for Queens County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate

and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Reports on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

Garth Marchant requested to discuss a Petition Cover Sheet matter concerning Everly Brown, a Queens County candidate. After discussion, Commissioner Sipp moved to reverse the determination of the Commissioners Cover Sheet Review Committee that upon the filing of the incorrect Amended Cover Sheet after the due date constitutes a nullity, so that the original Cover Sheet claiming only seven (7) Volumes is deemed valid. Commissioner Barrera seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Umane moved to adjourn the Hearings which was unanimously adopted.

President Umane moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of personnel which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the public meeting resumed and President Umane announced the action taken in Executive Session:

- I. The Commissioners appointed Stanley Baily to the title of Associate Staff Analyst in the General Office at the annual salary of \$66,391, effective Sunday, August 4, 2013.

President Umane moved to adjourn the meeting which was unanimously adopted.

Hearings on selected second call Designating Petition matters, Hearings on Opportunity to Ballot Petitions, and the next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, August 6, 2013 at 1:30pm.