MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, JUNE 18, 2019 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President John Wm. Zaccone

Secretary Patricia Anne Taylor

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Miguelina Camilo, John Flateau, Michael Michel, Simon Shamoun, Robert Siano, Tiffany Townsend

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Steven Guglielmi, Director, Personnel
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communication & Public Affairs
Sherwin Suss, Agency Chief Contracting Officer, Procurement
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Monica Bartley, CIDNY

Wendy Byrne, LWV NYC

Adam Edwards, Common Cause

Kate Doran, LWV

President Zaccone called the meeting to order at 1:37 P.M.

Mr. Ryan requested to add an item to the agenda concerning a discussion on a Ballot On Demand system for Early Voting. President Zaccone added the item to the agenda.

Commissioner Araujo moved to convene an Executive Session for potential litigation and personnel regarding employee disciplinary matters, sick and/or annual leave time, and salary. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed. President Zaccone reported that potential litigation was discussed and the Commissioners took several actions on personnel matters which will be reported at a later date.

The following actions were taken by unanimous decision of the Board of Commissioners in Executive Session:

- Michael Madison, a Financial Clerk, was granted 105 hours of an Advance of Time. This grant is effective June 14, 2019.
 Mr. Madison's Agency Start Date is March 12, 2012;
- II. Michael Mattis, a Voting Machine Technician, was granted up to 280 hours, as needed, of an Advance of Time. This grant is effective June 14, 2019. Mr. Mattis' Agency Start Date is October 3, 2010;

- III. Ratification of the Stipulation of Settlement signed by John Langer on June 17, 2019. Mr. Langer holds the title of a Voting Machine Technician;
- IV. Ratification of the Stipulation of Settlement signed by Brenda Sargeant on June 17, 2019. Ms. Sargeant holds the title of Clerk;
- V. Ratification of the Stipulation of Settlement signed by Tobias Russo on June 17, 2019. Mr. Russo holds the title of Clerk;
- VI. Ratification of the Stipulation of Settlement signed by Rigoberto Bosquez on June 17, 2019. Mr. Bosquez holds the title of Financial Clerk;
- VII. Ratification of the Stipulation of Settlement signed by Tyletha Samuels on June 17, 2019. Ms. Samuels holds the title of Clerk;
- VIII. Ratification of the Stipulation of Settlement signed by Michael C. Rendino on May 24, 2019. Mr. Rendino holds the title of a Voting Machine Technician.

President Zaccone noted that Item #4 will be addressed before Item #3 on the agenda.

Commissioner Townsend moved to adopt the June 11, 2019 minutes.

Commissioner Camilo seconded the motion, with Commissioner Flateau abstaining. The motion was adopted.

Mr. Ryan requested to table Item #4 (a.) Poll Worker Bonus and Item #4 (b.) Private Poll Site Pay. President Zaccone tabled these items until further notice.

Mr. Suss reported on a Ballot On Demand (BOD) system for Early Voting sites. He explained that a BOD system prints a ballot after the voter checks-in at the poll site which would increase efficiency and reduce ballot printing costs. Mr. Ryan reported that both Houses passed the bill on the elimination of ballot stubs and center perforation requirements, and another form of ballot accountability rules will be promulgated by the State Board of Elections. The Board anticipates the Governor signing this bill. noted that the bill on the elimination of printing color on ballots passed as Mr. Rvan requested permission to use a BOD system contingent well. upon the Governor signing the bill. It was noted that the BOD systems were integrated with the Electronic Poll Book public demonstrations several Mr. Suss explained that there is a direct BOD system and weeks ago. non-direct BOD system. The direct BOD system has an E-Poll Book that

contains ballot PDF's and transmits the PDF to a printer once the voter checks-in at the poll site. The non-direct BOD system is an E-Poll Book that will transmit a signal to another device, either a tablet or laptop, which then selects the PDF, and sends it to the printer. Board staff recommends selecting a non-direct BOD system in the event there is a communication failure in the poll site; the other device serves as a back-up which allows the continuation of printing ballots. Mr. Suss reported that KNOWINK E-Poll Book vendor has partnered with Dominion's non-direct BOD system. The system set-up uses a tablet and printer, has a battery backup, and is contained in a metal cabinet with security locks. The set-up has one (1) E-Poll Book per one (1) BOD system and can be directly wired, if needed. Mr. Suss reported that there were two (2) non-direct BOD system vendors available and one (1) vendor declined. Mr. Suss recommended ordering a not to exceed amount of 1,500 BOD systems – 10 systems for each Early Voting site, 50 systems for each borough for training purposes, and 670 systems available to expand to poll sites in the future. Additional BOD systems can be requested in the future, if needed. Mr. Suss reported that it is the staff's recommendation to enter into contract negotiations with KNOWINK's BOD system which is in accordance with the City's Policy and Procurement Board (PPB) Rules. Based on the report, Commissioner Araujo moved to accept the recommendation of staff to begin contract negotiations with KNOWINK's non-direct BOD system as presented, which is subject to final approval by the Commissioners. Commissioner Camilo seconded the motion, with Commissioners Michel and Shamoun abstaining. The motion was adopted. Commissioner Shamoun noted that he abstained because he would have preferred more information and more time to review BOD system options.

President Zaccone noted that Commissioner Camilo and Commissioner Siano left the meeting.

Mr. Ryan provided a status update on the June 25, 2019 Primary Election. The information follows:

- There is a total of 2,312,070 eligible voters;
- A total of 936 poll sites will be open;
- A total of 3,945 ED's will be reporting;
- Total amount of equipment to be deployed in the field:
 - o 2,394 Scanners;
 - 965 Ballot Marking Devices (BMDs);
 - 3,945 Supply Carts;
 - 8,073 Privacy Booths;
 - o 22,935 Chairs;

- o 5,128 Tables;
- ADA Ramp Systems:
 - o 355 poll sites require vendor installation;
 - 12 poll sites require BOE installation;
- A total of 1,009 cane detectable elements will be installed in poll sites.

President Zaccone reported that there have been complaints about the Election Day chairs being flimsy and requested for the Voting Equipment Operations Unit and Election Day Operations staff to look into renting different chairs for the future.

Mr. Richman introduced the new law student summer interns who are working in the Office of the General Counsel. The Commissioners welcomed the interns to the Board.

President Zaccone recognized the following speaker for public comment:

1. Kate Doran.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Wednesday, June 26, 2019 at 1:00 P.M.

President Zaccone moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded, and unanimously adopted.