## MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 14, 2017 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Frederic M. Umane

Secretary Rosanna Vargas

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Michael Michel, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Robert Siano, John Wm. Zaccone

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Steven Guglielmi, Acting Director, Personnel
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Rosemarie Hameed

Kate Doran, LWVNYC

Alex Camarda, Reinvent Albany

Eric Friedman, CFB Amanda Melillo, CFB Wendy Byrne, LWVNYC Brigid Bergin, WNYC Susan Lerner, CC/NY

Katharine Loving, NYC CFB Catherine T. Gray, LWVNYC

Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the minutes for the October 31, 2017 meeting. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Umane recognized Susan Lerner, Executive Director of Common Cause New York, who spoke about the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affair's (MOIA) Russian and Haitian Creole language translators who worked on Election Day, and requested for a collaborative approach for the 2018 elections. In response to Ms. Lerner, the Commissioners and Executive Management raised the following concerns about MOIA's program:

- The speedy implementation of the program for the Mayoral and City Council election in which the candidates who helped fund the program were seeking to be re-elected;
- The specific languages that were chosen by MOIA and the Districts the MOIA translators were placed in, as other communities were excluded citywide. Specifically, Midland Beach and South Beach in Staten Island, large communities of Russian speaking voters, were excluded from MOIA's program;

- Equal protection laws. There are approximately 180 languages spoken in New York City which may give rise to other groups excluded from the assistance;
- The MOIA's translators were not recruited on a bi-partisan basis and did not work on a bi-partisan basis such as the current Board's language assistance interpreters and poll workers which is required by law.

The Commissioners reiterated that the Board follows the New York State Election Law and the Voting Rights Act with respect to the required Language Assistance Program. Mr. Ryan reported that he had spoken with various community groups and other organizations in the past to recruit volunteers in their communities to assist fellow voters on Election Day, but no such group has come forward to date.

Mr. Ryan provided an update on the November 7, 2017 General Election. The post election information follows:

- A total of 98.29% of the Portable Memory Devices (PMDs) were uploaded on Election Night;
- Election night results were uploaded in the 9:15 P.M. –
   9:20 P.M. range, the same amount of time as recent previous election events;

- The Board's website received 777,389 hits on Election Day, opposed to 191,018 hits on 2016 General Election Day and 275,777 hits for the 2013 Mayoral General Election. Based on the amount of hits, the public is relying more on the Board's website as their source for election night results;
- The Board's Call Center received many calls for the 2013
   Mayoral General Election results, but there were few calls for this Mayoral election;
- Approximately 3,000 tablets were implemented;
- A total of 16 tablets were swapped out on Election Day;
- There was 1 Hot Spot per poll site with 95% connectivity citywide. Some poll sites that are located in basements have connectivity challenges. Those results are still polled and then uploaded externally.

Mr. Ryan reported that he will provide additional final reports at the next meeting along with the Certification of the election.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Board received an invitation to the New York State Assembly Standing Committee on Election Law Hearing concerning cyber security scheduled on Tuesday, November 28, 2017 at 10:00 A.M. Mr. Ryan requested authorization to prepare testimony and to

attend the Hearing. Commissioner Schulkin moved to authorize Executive Management to attend and testify at the Hearing. The motion was seconded, and unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Flateau inquired about the voter turnout on Election Day. Mr. Ryan reported that there was a 1,092,000 voter turnout. There were a total of 4.5 million eligible voters. In the 2013 Mayoral General Election, the voter turnout was 1,070,000.

Commissioner Flateau inquired about the current amount of paper ballots citywide. Mr. Ryan reported that staff is still working on that task and he will report the final numbers at the next meeting.

Secretary Vargas moved to convene Executive Session for personnel matters. President Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed.

Mr. Ryan reported that the next Commissioners' Meeting will be held on Tuesday, November 28, 2017 at 1:30 P.M. due to the Thanksgiving holiday next week.

Mr. Ryan reported the following action that was taken in Executive Session:

I. The Commissioners granted 35 hours Advance of Time to Tamika Moore, an Administrative Assistant in the Manhattan Office, retroactive to November 6, 2017. Ms. Moore's agency start date is September 8, 2014.

President Umane moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Siano seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, November 28, 2017 at 1:30 P.M.