MEETING OF THE BOARD OF CANVASSERS AND THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 26, 2017 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Frederic M. Umane

Secretary Rosanna Vargas

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Michael Michel, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, John Wm. Zaccone

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director

Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager

Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager

Steven H. Richman, General Counsel

Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel

Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications

Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel

Troy Johnson, Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit

Rayvon Weaver, Project Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit

Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office

Lisa Sattie, Administrative Associate, Staten Island Office

Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office

Robert Pataky, Administrative Associate, Queens Office

Greg Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office

William A. Allen, Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office

Raymond Riley, Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office

Daniel Ortiz, Deputy Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office

Brendaliz Candelaria, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office

Rocco Cirotti, Administrative Associate, Bronx Office

Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners

Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Monica Bartley, CIDNY

Brady Conley

Katharine Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board Alan Flacks, Member of NY Democratic Committee

President Umane called the meeting to order at 1:34 P.M.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, specifically Sections 9-204, 9-210 and 9-212, President Umane called the meeting of the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York to order for the purposes of certifying the recanvass of votes cast on the September 12, 2017 Primary Election for Public Offices and Party Positions conducted within the City of New York.

President Umane designated the Republican Commissioner for the respective counties and Commissioner Michel to serve with him for New York County as well as the multi-borough districts and the Citywide Recap Reports.

Secretary Vargas designated the Democratic Commissioner for the respective counties and Commissioner Schulkin to serve with him for Bronx County as well as the multi-borough districts and the Citywide Recap Reports.

The Deputy Chief Clerks of the Bronx and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions in Bronx County, in accordance with this Board's Policies and Procedures. Ms. Candelaria and Mr. Cirotti, on behalf of Mr. Ribustello, presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Candelaria and Mr. Cirotti confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Secretary Vargas moved that the Board of certify the Returns of Canvass submitted Canvassers September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions conducted in Bronx County. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Queens and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions in Queens County, in accordance with this Board's Policies and Procedures. Mr. Haggerty and Mr. Pataky, on behalf of Ms. Conacchio,

presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Haggerty and Mr. Pataky confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Araujo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions conducted in Queens County. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Staten Island and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions in Richmond County, in accordance with this Board's Policies and Procedures. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie, on behalf of Ms. Del Giorno, presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct. There was one (1) discrepancy which did not change the outcome of the results. The Discrepancy Report is attached to the

canvass. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie confirmed that the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Zaccone moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions conducted in Richmond County. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Manhattan and their staff signed the have prepared and Returns of Canvass for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions in New York County, in accordance with this Board's Policies and Procedures, with the exception of the Independence Party Opportunity to Ballot Primary Election for Member of the City Council for the 1st Council District. That contest, pursuant to the Board's Policies and Procedures, is the subject of a hand recount with less than 10 votes separating the two candidates with the greatest number of votes. Mr. Lehman and Mr. Allen, presented the Returns of Canvass to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Lehman and Mr. Allen confirmed that the results presented

are accurate and correct. Mr. Lehman and Mr. Allen confirmed that the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, President Umane moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions conducted in New York County. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk of Brooklyn and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions in Kings County, in accordance with this Board's Policies and Procedures. Mr. Riley and Mr. Ortiz presented them to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Riley and Mr. Ortiz confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there were no discrepancies, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Flateau moved that the Board of Canvassers

certify the Returns of Canvass submitted for the September 12, 2017 Primary Elections for Public Offices and Party Positions conducted in Kings County. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Shamoun moved to approve and adopt the Recap Statement and Return of Canvass for the Public Office Primary Elections conducted on September 12, 2017 for Citywide Public Offices as well as those Council Districts which cross borough lines within the City of New York. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Flateau moved to authorize the use of the Commissioners' signature stamps as appropriate on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adjourn the meeting of the Board of Canvassers and to convene the weekly stated meeting of the Commissioners of Elections in the City of New York. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Umane added a litigation matter to Executive Session.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the minutes for the September 19, 2017 meeting. The motion was seconded, with Secretary Vargas and Commissioner Flateau abstaining. The motion was adopted. It was noted that Commissioner Flateau was not present at September 19, 2017 meeting, and the minutes will be revised to reflect his absence.

President Umane requested confirmation of the Board's Rules concerning extraneous marks outside the write-in's designated area on the ballot. Mr. Richman confirmed that the City Board follows the State Board's Rules concerning this matter. If the write-in name is not written in the designated write-in space at all, it is deemed invalid. If there is a tie in a race, the appropriate Party Committee will be given notice and the Party's State Committee will designated the candidate for their Party.

Commissioner Zaccone moved to convene Executive Session for purposes of personnel and litigation. Secretary Vargas seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and Mr. Ryan reported the following action taken in Executive Session:

I. The Commissioners granted 280 hours Advance of Time to Nancy McLaurin, an Administrative Assistant in the General Office, retroactive to September 8, 2017. Ms. McLaurin's agency start date is May 28, 2006.

President Umane moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded, and unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, October 3, 2017 at 1:30 P.M.