MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 2017 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Frederic M. Umane

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Lisa Grey, Maria R. Guastella, Michael Michel, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager Steven H. Richman, General Counsel Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs Sherwin Suss, Agency Chief Contract Officer, Procurement Thomas Sattie, Associate Staff Analyst, Ballot Management Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Rosemarie Hameed K. Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board Kate Doran, LWVNYC Amanda Melillo, NYC CFB Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee

President Umane called the meeting to order at 1:32 P.M.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the minutes for the January 31, 2017 meeting. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Board received the annual City of New York Conflicts of Interest Board (COIB) memorandum dated January 27, 2017 concerning substantial policy discretion. Mr. Ryan presented a draft response letter addressed to the COIB. Copies of the draft letter were distributed to the Commissioners for review and approval. President Umane moved to adopt the response letter to the New York City Conflict of Interest Board as submitted. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan requested to add a Finance Committee Report concerning Election Day Car Service. Mr. Suss provided an overview of the contract. This car service is to transport AD Monitor Teams and other staff members to various locations on Election Day. The three (3) year contract is for approximately 500 cars citywide and is an "as needed, not to exceed" contract. The sealed bidding process commenced in October 2016 and the vendor responses and bid total is the following:

• First Class Car & Limousine (Class 1, 2, 3) - \$2,932,500

- Corporate Transportation (Class 1, 2, 3) \$3,600,000
- Executive Charge (Class 1, 2, 3) \$4,402,500
- Skyline Credit A Ride (Class 1, 2, 3) \$4,500,000

Mr. Suss reported that First Class Car & Limousine is the lowest responsible bidder and recommended awarding them the contract. The Commissioners inquired about car service issues in the boroughs in the past. Mr. Suss noted that the After Hours Car Service had some issues which are currently being investigated as well as alternative car service providers. President Umane moved to select First Class Car & Limousine pursuant to the terms of this contract. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, with Commissioner Shamoun abstaining. The motion was adopted.

President Umane noted that Commissioner Shamoun joined the meeting.

Mr. Ryan recommended ordering 65% of ballots for the registered voters per Election District (ED) and 50 affidavit ballots per ED for the February 14, 2017 Special Election in the 9th Council District in New York County. Mr. Sattie reported that this amount would be more than sufficient for this election which was based on previous Special Elections. President

Umane moved to order 65% of ballots for the registered voters per ED and 50 affidavit ballots per ED for the February 14, 2017 Special Election in the 9th Council District in New York County. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan provided an update on the Election Day operations for the February 14, 2017 Special Election in New York County. The information follows:

- General Office AD Monitoring Teams have been assigned and will receive refresher training;
- The yellow AD Monitor name badges have been printed and will be distributed to the boroughs before the end of the week;
- 92% of the poll workers have been assigned to work to date;
- Election Night Reporting Clerks, AD Monitors and Stand-bys are still in the process of being assigned;
- 35 poll sites will be open which affects 106,397 registered voters in 125 Election Districts;
- 1,153 individual pieces of equipment will be deployed;
- 93 scanners and 35 Ballot Marking Devices (BMDs) will be deployed. Delivery will commence tomorrow through February 13, 2017;

- 5 ADA ramps will be installed by vendors, 5 ADA ramps will be installed by Board staff, and 8 ADA ramps will be installed by on-site personnel;
- All Poll Books, poll site prep notices, Special Election notices, and "Notices to Work" have been printed and distributed;
- The Manhattan VMF Election Day Call Center will be completely set-up by the end of the week;
- A total of 70 tablets will be utilized which have been tested and will be delivered to the Manhattan VMF today;
- The Table Finder, Poll Site Locator, Poll Worker Check-in, and Election Night Reporting (ENR) Apps will be utilized on the tablets;
- There are currently 22 Chinese Interpreter positions with 4 vacancies and 7 stand-bys;
- There are currently 42 Spanish Interpreter positions with 2 vacancies and 9 stand-bys.

Commissioner Schulkin inquired if those voters who needed to be restored have been reactivated. Mr. Ryan reported that those individuals on the citywide list have been reviewed by Borough staff and Legal staff. Those individuals required to be reactivated have been restored.

Commissioner Araujo requested for an update on poll worker recruitment outreach. He recalled that he had recommended to Executive Management and Ms. Vazquez for poll worker recruitment/training/ad campaigns to be extended earlier before the summer. Mr. Ryan reported that Board staff is currently looking into expanding poll worker recruitment/training/ads as well as voter education since there were many first time registered voters due to the 2016 Presidential Election. Mr. Ryan reported that during a post 2016 General Election meeting, in a preliminary analysis, it was found that ballot jam issues were largely voter related, particularly with the 19" ballot and DS 200 voting machine tray. Board staff has asked the vendor to extend the DS 200 tray and is waiting Ms. Vazquez reported that she and Mr. Suss are currently for feedback. working on extending the outdoor poll worker outreach ads. Currently, the ad period is from April 1st – June 1st. They are currently waiting for a cost estimate from the vendor for ad placement moving past June 1st. Ms. Vazquez reported that digital poll worker ads were more successful than newspaper ads specifically in the required languages. Digital ads such as banners on websites had a lot of hits. Commissioner Araujo recommended extending the outreach ads other to community newspapers, churches, civic groups and non-profit organizations. Commissioner Flateau requested for a comprehensive list of all Language

Assistance Programs (LAP) contacts from Ms. Knipel, the Coordinator of Ms. Vazquez noted that the Board could utilize geographical LAP. electronic fencing which targets communities online within specific areas. The Board could push outreach to specific zip codes. Ms. Vazguez reported that she and Ms. Kontzamanis had a conversation with a vendor who does grassroots outreach such as posting posters in local stores/supermarkets/bodegas on а specific community basis. Commissioner Araujo recommended for the Board to move on these ideas as soon as possible. Mr. Ryan suggested for Ms. Vazquez to create a detailed poll worker/voter outreach proposal for the Commissioners.

President Umane recognized Rosemarie Hameed, a member of the pubic, who spoke about poll worker/voter outreach.

President Umane moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of litigation. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

After Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and Mr. Ryan reported that no action was taken in Executive Session.

President Umane moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on February 21, 2017 at 1:30 P.M.