MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 13, 2016 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: Secretary Frederic M. Umane

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Lisa Grey, Michael Michel, Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Rosanna Vargas

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager Steven H. Richman, General Counsel Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Cathy Gray Kate Doran, LWVNYC Katharine Loving, NYC CFB Anna-Maria Thomas Amanda Melillo, NYC CFB Bill Perkins

In the absence of the President and Secretary, Commissioner Araujo

called the meeting to order at 1:45 P.M.

Commissioner Araujo moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of personnel. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.

Secretary Umane joined the meeting.

After Executive Session, Secretary Umane reconvened the open public meeting.

Commissioner Grey moved to adopt the minutes for the December 6, 2016 meeting. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the minutes for the December 8, 2016 Meeting of the Borough Committee of Board of Canvassers for Queens County. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Schulkin moved to adopt the minutes for the December 8, 2016 Meeting of the Borough Committee of Board of

2

Canvassers for New York County. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan reported that the New York Daily News praised the Board in a recent editorial with respect to accurately conducting and tallying the elections. The editorial noted that the Board is "light years ahead of other jurisdictions" when conducting the audit of close elections.

Mr. Ryan provided a report on the New York State Assembly Standing Committee on Election Law Hearing that was held on November 29, 2016 in Albany, NY. Copies of the State Board's testimony were distributed to the Commissioners. Mr. Ryan noted that the City Board did not provide written testimony as the Hearing was held in close proximity of the Presidential General Election. Mr. Ryan reported that he answered various questions from the Committee relating to cyber security and future government interfaces to protect the integrity of the election systems. The Committee reported that the I.P. addresses, which were provided by the Federal Bureau of Investigations (FBI), had no attempted access points to the City Board's Firewall security system. Mr. Ryan reported on the actions that were taken in Executive Session:

- The Commissioners unanimously granted an advance of 140 discretionary hours to Frank Tosi, an Administrative Associate in the Bronx Office. Mr. Tosi's agency start date is October 24, 2004;
- II. The Commissioners unanimously granted an advance of 140 hours to Gail Kearney, a Clerk in the Brooklyn Office.Ms. Kearney's agency start date is January 31, 2016.

On behalf of the Commissioners, Secretary Umane wished everyone a wonderful holiday season.

Secretary Umane noted that there will be a Republican Caucus after the meeting.

Secretary Umane moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, January 3, 2017 at 1:30 P.M.