MEETING OF THE BOARD OF CANVASSERS AND THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2016 AT 1:30 P.M.

42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK. NY 10004

PRESENT: President Maria R. Guastella

Secretary Frederic M. Umane

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Lisa Grey, Michael Michael, Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Rosanna Vargas

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager Steven H. Richman, General Counsel Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel Troy Johnson, Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit Rayvon Weaver, Project Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office Lisa Sattie, Administrative Associate, Staten Island Office Rocco Cirotti, Administrative Associate, Bronx Office Brendaliz Candelaria, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office Salvatore Barrera, Acting Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office Daniel Ortiz, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Quinn Formel

Amanda Melillo, NYC CFB

Kate Doran, LWVNYC

Katharine Loving, NYC CFB Miranda Newberer, Politico NY

Dawn Irby

President Guastella called the meeting to order at 1:42 P.M.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, President Guastella called the meeting of the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York to order for the purposes of certifying the recanvass of votes cast on November 8, 2016 in the General Election in three of the five boroughs of the City of New York.

To serve as the other Democratic Member of the Canvassing Board, President Guastella designated the Democratic Commissioner for their respective counties and Commissioner Vargas to serve with her for Richmond County and the multi-county recaps. Secretary Umane designated the Republican Commissioner for their respective counties and Commissioner Rendino to serve with him for New York County and the multi-county recaps.

The Deputy Chief Clerks of the Bronx Office and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election and Special Election conducted in Bronx County on November 8, 2016. Ms. Candelaria, Deputy Chief Clerk, and Mr. Cirotti, Administrative Associate, on behalf of Mr. Ribustello, Deputy Chief Clerk,

presented them to the Canvassing Board for their review and approval. Ms. Candelaria and Mr. Cirotti confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all provisions of the New York State Election Law and this Board's adopted Policies and Procedures were complied with, the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests, and there are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Vargas moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Special Election conducted Election and in Bronx County November 8, 2016. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of the Staten Island Office and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election and Special Election conducted in Richmond County on November 8, 2016. Mr. Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, and Ms. Sattie, Administrative Associate, on behalf of Ms. Del Giorno, Chief Clerk, presented them to the Canvassing Board for their review and approval. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all provisions of the New York

State Election Law and this Board's adopted Policies and Procedures were complied with, the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests, and there are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Grey moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election and Special Election conducted in Richmond County on November 8, 2016. President Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Acting Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk of the Brooklyn Office and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election and Special Election conducted in Kings County on November 8, 2016. Mr. Barrera, Acting Chief Clerk, and Mr. Ortiz, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, presented them to the Canvassing Board for their review and approval. Mr. Barrera and Mr. Ortiz confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all provisions of the New York State Election Law and this Board's adopted Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully

completed for these contests. A detailed Discrepancy Report was summarized and attached to the Return of Canvass. Based on that report, Commissioner Shamoun moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election and Special Election conducted in Kings County on November 8, 2016. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Commissioners thanked the Borough Office staff members for their hard work during this election cycle.

President Guastella reported that the staff assigned to the Manhattan and Queens Offices continue to work diligently to complete its work. Pursuant to Section 3-212(5) of the New York State Election Law, Commissioner Grey moved for the Commissioners to authorize and empower the Manhattan and Queens Borough Commissioners Committees, upon appropriate notice, to meet and act as the Board of Canvassers to certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the November 8, 2016 General Election conducted in New York County and Queens County, and any applicable multi-county recapitulation statements for districts that includes part of New York and/or Queens Counties and

another county within the City of New York. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Guastella moved to approve and adopt the Recap Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted on November 8, 2016 for those Districts which cross county lines within the City of New York and whose respective counties' Statement and Return of Canvass have been approved today. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Grey moved to authorize the use of the Commissioners' signature stamps as appropriate on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Guastella moved to adjourn the meeting of the Board of Canvassers and to convene the weekly stated meeting of the Commissioners of Elections in the City of New York. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Flateau moved to adopt the minutes for the November 29, 2016 meeting. Commissioner Grey seconded the motion, with Commissioner Araujo abstaining. The motion was adopted.

President Guastella reported on a personnel matter. Gail Kearney, a Clerk in the Brooklyn Office, has requested for an advance of 70 hours, retroactive to November 20, 2016 and to be paid back upon her return. Ms. Kearney's agency start date is January 31, 2016. Commissioner Flateau moved to grant the request as submitted. Commissioner Grey seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Guastella recognized Amanda Melillo, a representative of the New York City Campaign Finance Board, who announced that there is a Voter Assistance Advisory Committee (VAAC) Meeting tonight at 5:30 P.M. located at 2 Lafayette Street, 14th Floor, concerning 2016 election experiences.

Commissioner Shamoun requested to discuss a personnel matter in Executive Session.

President Guastella moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of personnel. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and President Guastella reported that no action was taken in Executive Session.

President Guastella moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Grey seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, December 13, 2016 at 1:30 P.M.