Approved # 3233

HEARINGS ON DESIGNATING PETITION MATTERS FOR THE JUNE 28, 2016 FEDERAL PRIMARY ELECTION AND THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, MAY 3, 2016 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Bianka Perez Secretary Frederic M. Umane

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Lisa Grey, Michael Michel, Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager Steven H. Richman, General Counsel Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel Troy Johnson, Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit Rayvon Weaver, Project Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit Shanette Brown, Administrative Assistant, Candidate Records Unit Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office Lisa Sattie, Administrative Associate, Staten Island Office Frank Tosi, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office Lissette Poll, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office Robert Pataky, Administrative Associate, Queens Office Gregory Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office William Anthony Allen, Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Saundra Ramirez Steiner

Egidio Sementilli Andrew Tulloch, for Maloney Lucia Gomez, for Espaillat Arthur Greig, for Caceres Ryan Sit, NY Daily News Yvonne Gouglet **Bruce Rosen** Elliot Crown Andy Lun, for Yung Man Lee Tom Loo **Yvonne Liu** Sam Cheng Alison Hall Alan Barchett Kate Doran, LWV NYC Mark Escoffery-Bey Brigid Burgi, WNYC Arlene Fader Katharine Loving, CFB Jeanine Johnson, for Wright Elmo Doij, for Yun Kurzon Nabin Mandal Emily McCov **Clement Pairot** Jeremiah Bormemahn Pete Lidner Diana Finch, Poll Worker Jonathan Reich Anna Maria Thomas Phoebe Berg Thomas Gallagher Wendy Sacks Kim Sillen Jessica Kramer Angelika Nyzio Samantha Minten **Joel Bridges** Matt Tsui **Nick Childers** Jeremy Arcan Jonah Balger

Beth Grundfest-Frigieri Marni Halasa Lisa Barri, for Nicholas Dedual Karen Chamberlain Paul Olson Jesse Bernelli M. Starfurgein Andy O. Kuneff Michael Harrington Nisi Jacobs Laura Delhauer Kwoklah Fan Brian Douglas Marc Cowte Jeffrey Griffin, WFP/Meng Yohany M. Ceers Virginia Sunfar Wellington Eheyaray Armand Autram Jesse Cervantes T. Lous **Rich Newman** Angelica Thornhill Frances M. Perez Dawn Stewart-Lookkah Kumiko Michelski **Michelle Luggium** Clifford Dodd Sam Sloan Sarah McAllister A.B. Britton, K.L.C. GOP **Caroline Durham** Jeremy Moss Niko House Katherine Graves Marc Weinstein Adam Raull Nancy Wolfe Dana Elzenbeck Henry Frank **Richard Sterne**

Jose Venegur Louis Armiteaf Rose McCoy

President Perez called the meeting to order at 1:57 P.M.

President Perez moved to postpone the certification of the April 19, 2016 Presidential Primary Election until Thursday, May 5, 2016 at 3:30 P.M. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Secretary Umane moved to authorize a Commissioners Committee consisting of either two (2) or four (4) Commissioners, equally Democratic and Republican, to act as representatives for each Party if there are less than six (6) Commissioners, for the April 19, 2016 Presidential Primary Election certification. Commissioner Rendino seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Perez moved for the Board to certify the April 19, 2016 Special Elections tomorrow, May 4, 2016 at 11:00 A.M. Secretary Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. Secretary Umane moved to authorize a Commissioners Committee consisting of either two (2) or four (4) Commissioners, equally Democratic and Republican, to act as representatives for each Party if there are less than six (6) Commissioners, for the certification of the April 19, 2016 Special Elections. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.

Ms. Sandow, Ms. Perkins and Ms. Kontzamanis joined the meeting.

President Perez convened the Hearings on Designating Petitions for the June 28, 2016 Federal Primary Election.

President Perez stated the procedures to be followed during the Hearings and called upon Mr. Richman to call the Calendar. Mr. Richman called the Calendar for the Hearings and noted that the Calendar was posted for the public as required.

Mr. Richman presented the joint Legal/CRU Prima Facie Report. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Legal/CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Legal/CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Richman presented the Clerks' Reports on Specifications of Objections. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerks' Reports on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerks' Report acted upon. Specification Nos. NY 19-1 and BK 20-1 were placed on second call. Specification No. BX 5-1 was adjourned to Wednesday, May 4, 2016 at 11:00 A.M.

The Manhattan Office Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk submitted a memorandum to the Commissioners stating that the following New York County Specifications of Objections have been determined to not be worked pursuant to the provisions of Rule H12 of the Board's Designating Petition and Opportunity to Ballot Petition Rules, which are as follows: NY 5-1, NY 14-1, NY 15-1, and NY 16-1.

Mr. Richman presented the Counsels' Reports on Specifications of Objections. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Counsels' Reports on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Counsels' Reports on file at the Board. The Counsel's Report on Specification of Objection NY4-1 was placed on second call.

President Perez moved to convene an Executive Session for personnel matters. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

After Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed.

President Perez called the matters that were placed on second call. The Commissioners' determinations on these second call matters are reflected on the respective Clerks' Reports and Counsel's Report on file at the Board.

The Commissioners unanimously adjourned the Hearings.

President Perez called the regular stated meeting of the Commissioners to order at 4:05 P.M.

Commissioner Schulkin moved to adopt the minutes for the April 12, 2016 and April 26, 2016 meetings. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Board received notice of the New York City Council's Hearing on the Proposed Executive Expense, Revenue, Capital and Contract Budgets for Fiscal Year 2017 scheduled on May 13, 2016. Mr. Ryan requested permission to prepare Testimony and to testify at the Hearing. Secretary Umane moved to authorize Executive Management to prepare Testimony and to testify at the City Council's Hearing on the Proposed Executive Expense, Revenue, Capital and Contract Budgets for Fiscal Year 2017 scheduled on May 13, 2016. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Richman requested for the appointment of a Cover Sheet Review Committee to meet immediately after the Meeting. Secretary Umane and Commissioner Schulkin volunteered to serve as the Cover Sheet Review Committee.

President Perez opened the floor to members of the public and allowed each member two (2) minutes to speak:

1. Saundra Ramirez, a Brooklyn voter, raised concerns about the voter purge and voting by affidavit ballot.

- 2. Elliot Crown, a Manhattan voter, raised concerns about the voting machine's software.
- 3. Lisa Barri, a delegate, raised concerns about possible misinformation given by a poll worker concerning delegates, and the canvassing process in the Manhattan Office. Board staff collected Ms. Barri's information to look into these matters further. Secretary Umane reminded the public that voting instructions are printed on the ballots.
- 4. Jesse Bonelli, a poll watcher, raised concerns about the canvassing process of affidavit ballots.
- 5. Laura Delhauer, a voter, raised concerns about her voter registration experience.
- Yvonne Gouglet, a member of the public, insisted for the Board to stop the certification of the Presidential Primary Election.
- 7. Angelica Thornhill, a Brooklyn voter, raised concerns about her and other voters' Parties being switched to "no Party" without authorization. Board staff collected Ms. Thornhill's information to look into the matter further. Mr. Ryan reviewed Ms. Thornhill's public voter registration history record and reported that Ms. Thornhill checked the "I do not wish to enroll in a Party" box and signed it on 9/25/12.

- 8. Phoebe Berg, a voter, raised concerns that her correct Party enrollment was not found online.
- 9. Nabin Mandal, a Queens voter, raised concerns about the canvassing process of affidavit ballots.
- 10. Andrew Fader, a Bronx voter, raised concerns about the canvassing process of affidavit ballots.
- 11. Jonathan Reichel, a Manhattan voter, raised concerns about possible misinformation given by poll workers concerning delegates.
- 12. Joel Bridges, a poll watcher, raised concerns about the canvassing process of affidavit ballots.
- 13. Marc Conte, a Brooklyn voter, raised concerns about Exit Poll numbers and the results.
- 14. Frances Perez, a poll worker, raised concerns about affidavit ballots at her poll site.
- 15. Caroline Durham, a voter, insisted for the Board to stop the certification of the Presidential Primary Election.
- 16. Jeremy Moss, a Brooklyn voter, raised concerns about his Party status being "blank" without his authorization. Board staff collected Mr. Moss' information to look into the matter further. Mr. Ryan reviewed Mr. Moss' public voter registration history

record and reported that Mr. Moss wrote in "None" for Party and signed it on 11/4/14.

Mr. Ryan reiterated to the members of the public that the Board is still in the process of validating and invalidating all affidavits in accordance with the New York State Election Law. This paper count also includes military, federal, and absentee voter ballots. Mr. Ryan restated that it is a cumbersome task for Board staff and it is an open and transparent canvassing process in all five (5) boroughs.

Mr. Ryan reported the following action that was taken in Executive Session:

 Joseph Duffy, a Queens Administrative Associate, was terminated, effective immediately.

The Commissioners unanimously adjourned the meeting.

The Meeting of the Board of Canvassers to certify the April 19, 2016 Special Elections, and the continuation of Hearings on Designating Petitions will be held on Wednesday, May 4, 2016 at 11:00 A.M.

The Meeting of the Board of Canvassers to certify the April 19, 2016 Presidential Primary Election will be held on Thursday, May 5, 2016 at 3:30 P.M.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, May 10, 2016 at 1:30 P.M.