Approved # 3143

## MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, MARCH 11, 2014 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Gregory C. Soumas Secretary Michael Michel

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Ronald Castorina, Julie Dent, Michael Rendino, Simon Shamoun, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager Steven H. Richman, General Counsel Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Kate Doran, LWV Marjorie Shea, Women's City Club Erin Schultz, DOI Annette Almazan, DOI John D. Smith Rachel Fauss, Citizens Union K. Loving

President Soumas called the meeting to order at 1:37 P.M.

Commissioner Dent moved to adopt the minutes of the March 4, 2014 meeting. President Soumas seconded the motion, with Commissioners Araujo and Umane abstaining. The motion was adopted. Commissioners Araujo and Umane abstained because they were not present at that meeting.

Mr. Ryan provided an update on Voter Cards. He recalled that this issue was discussed at the previous meeting and provided a summary of that discussion. Mr. Ryan reported that Executive Management recommends for the Board to eliminate Voter Cards and to move forward with the enhanced Privacy Sleeve. Commissioner Umane requested for the cost of the enhanced Privacy Sleeves compared to the Voter Cards for a citywide election, and noted that his main concern is ballot security. Commissioner Dent inquired if there would be any pockets in the Privacy Sleeve and which election that they would be implemented for. Mr. Ryan reported that staff has not discussed the specifications of the enhanced Privacy Sleeve yet, and staff aims to implement them for the 2014 September Primary Election. Commissioner Dent requested for a public advertisement of the enhanced Privacy Sleeves for the voters in advance of the election, if implemented. Mr. Ryan reported that there would be

2

public legal notices in various newspapers and information would be posted on the Board's website. He noted that he would like the Board to participate in other internet search engines which was indicated in the Presidential Commission on Election Administration Report. This issue will be discussed with the Commissioners Committee on Communications, Voter Registration and Outreach. Commissioner Umane noted that Voter Cards are sometimes used as a back-up in Court to help resolve discrepancies in close elections. Mr. Ryan reported that the Board is not under obligation to make case evidence available to Third Parties. Ms. Perkins reported that the Bronx Office has used the DS-200 Election District Tapes to help resolve discrepancies in the past. Mr. Ryan reported that five (5) out of sixty-two (62) county board of elections use Voter Cards in New York State. Commissioner Shamoun noted that ballot security is very important and inquired if the ballot can be enhanced as well. Mr. Ryan reported that currently there is ballot security, but those measures cannot be discussed in public for security reasons. Additional ballot security measures that can be used are watermarks and ink that cannot be photocopied. Commissioner Castorina confirmed that there will be cost savings associated with the production, as well as storage, of the Voter Cards if they are eliminated. The Board's two (2) goals are ballot security

3

and cost savings. Commissioner Umane requested for the calculation of costs of the Voter Cards and enhanced Privacy Sleeves for a citywide election. Mr. Ryan reported that there will be poll worker training on the enhanced Privacy Sleeve and staff will develop these procedures which will be reviewed by the Commissioners before implementation. Commissioner Michel moved to eliminate the Voter Cards. Commissioner Castorina seconded the motion, with President Soumas and Commissioner Umane opposing. The motion was adopted.

President Soumas moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of litigation. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the regular stated meeting resumed and President Soumas reported the following action taken in Executive Session:

 Commissioner Rendino moved to grant an advance of 45 hours of discretionary time to Shirelle Townes, a Clerk in the Bronx Office, due to surgery. Ms. Townes has been an employee for 12 years and this advance of time complies with the appropriate

4

rules and regulations. President Soumas seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Soumas moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, March 18, 2014 at 1:30 P.M.